



# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

## Board of Directors Minutes for Wednesday, February 15, 2017

NAIPTA  
3773 N. Kaspar Dr.  
Flagstaff, AZ 86004

**NOTE:** IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA BOARD MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

The Board of Directors met in Regular Session on Wednesday, February 15, 2017 at 10:00 am in the NAIPTA VERA Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004.

This was a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the Board attended in person, by telephone or internet conferencing. The public was invited to observe and participate in the meeting at the address above.

### BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

- Art Babbott (Chair), Board of Supervisors, Coconino County;
  - Scott Overton (Vice Chair), City Council, City of Flagstaff;
  - Eva Putzova, City Council, City of Flagstaff;
  - Joanne Keene, Executive Vice President and Chief of Staff, NAU;
  - Charlie Odegaard, City Council, City of Flagstaff, alternate (left at approximately 11:27am)
- \*Three of our five Board member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*  
*\*\*The City of Flagstaff holds two seats.*

### BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED:

- Matt Ryan, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County, alternate;
- Jamie Whelan, Vice Mayor, City of Flagstaff, alternate;
- Rich Bowen, Associate Vice President for Economic Development, NAU, alternate;
- Colleen Smith, President, CCC;
- Veronica Hipolito (Secretary), Dean of Students, CCC, designee

### NAIPTA STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

- Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager;
- Erika Mazza, Deputy General Manager;
- Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director (by WebEx);
- Jacki Lenners, Marketing Manager;
- Jon Matthies, IT Manager;
- Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager, approximate 11:08am arrival;
- Kate Morley, Mobility Planner;
- Alicia Becker, Transit Planner;
- Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board;



*Setting you where you want to go*





# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Fredda Bisman, NAIPTA Attorney (by WebEx)

### GUESTS PRESENT:

Todd Madeksza, Coconino County Public Affairs Director, NAIPTA TAC Member, left at approximately 11:27am;

Kendra Edens, Coconino County Resident, Williams Taxi, left at approximately 11:27am;

Jason Kelly, Northern Arizona Council of Governments (NACOG);

Dolores Paredes, Flagstaff Resident, Coconino County Community Services

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Babbott called the meeting to order at 10:00am.
2. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS
3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES 1/18/2017

Director Keene moved to approve the minutes as presented. Vice Chair Overton seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Mr. Meilbeck welcomed Joanne Keene to the Board, representing Northern Arizona University (NAU) and asked her to please thank Rich Payne for his many years of service on the Board. Chair Babbott also welcomed her.

### CONSENT ITEMS:

All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the Board of Directors to be routine and will be enacted by a single motion APPROVING THE CONSENT AGENDA. If discussion is desired on any particular consent item, that item will be removed from the consent agenda and will be considered separately. All items on the Consent Agenda with financial impact have been budgeted.

5. ADOPT FY2018 MEETING CALENDAR  
-Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board  
Staff recommends the Board of Directors adopt the FY2018 meeting dates.

Vice Chair Overton moved to approve item 5 under the consent agenda. Director Putzova seconded. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

### DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:

6. COCONINO COUNTY TAXI VOUCHERS: ROLE AND SERVICE LEVELS – WORK SESSION  
-Kate Morley, Mobility Manager



*Getting you where you want to go*





# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Staff is seeking direction from the Board regarding what NAIPTA's role outside of the NAIPTA boundary is, what service level should be provided, by who, and what method of service delivery.

Ms. Morley reviewed a PowerPoint presentation with the Board. She reiterated Mountain Lift clients are also eligible for the Taxi Voucher Program due to being functionally unable to ride the fixed route. Chair Babbott requested staff research the most efficient way to deliver service, even in our boundary. NAIPTA's boundary is the same as the Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization (FMPO). The chart of programs and costs was reviewed in detail. Chair Babbott asked for the number of trips in the City Taxi Voucher Program and he was told the number was not available at that moment. It was confirmed NAIPTA only pays the true cost of the trip up to a cap of \$30 per voucher for the County Taxi Voucher Program. It is a paper system. There was a question about how vouchers are used, particularly how many are used for long trips. A slide was reviewed with location information. Last year the City of Flagstaff picked up the funding shortfall. The increased demand for the program is thought to be from an increased word of mouth awareness of the program and our aging population. Each voucher is good for one trip. It is thought that most people use them roundtrip, so two vouchers are used when they go somewhere. NAIPTA has new software so it will be easier to track eligibility and usage going forward. The program allows for 12 vouchers per user, per month. The focus is on mobility. Options were discussed, including fixed route, paratransit, taxi vouchers and shared economy. An estimated cost comparison was reviewed. The trip purpose is approximately 2/3 for medical and 1/3 for shopping. Ms. Morley has spoken to Flagstaff Medical Center (FMC), Northern Arizona Council of Governments (NACOG) and others about this. She is in a data collection phase right now. FMC has spent approximately \$40,000 getting people home. We are not sure if this is related to the Affordable Care Act (ACA). North Country has a mobile unit. Mr. Meilbeck noted this is a national issue and it is complicated. The question remains regarding who will provide service: NAIPTA, Human Service Agencies, NACOG, Coconino County or Medical Service Providers. NACOG receives 5310 mobility management funds from the federal government. Coconino County and Williams are both members of NACOG. Chair Babbott pointed out that many of these agencies probably have underused resources. Their assets could be used. Discounts should be negotiated with the taxi companies. Mr. Kelly, from NACOG, stated they have one and a half staff working on mobility management in their office. Maps were shown on screen of NACOG, Coconino County, City of Flagstaff and NAIPTA boundaries and where the 70 users of the Taxi Voucher Program reside. Vice Chair Overton noted that the City of Flagstaff has been in a position of shoring up the program, but it is not sustainable. The City and County have a budget and when the approved funds are gone, that's it. Mr. Meilbeck stated the program started so small and that has changed significantly. We need direction on how to get through FY2017 and then address FY2018 due to the increasing demand. In looking at the funding stream, circumstances have changed. Board members wondered if the City of Williams is aware of this situation. Ms. Morley reported NAIPTA invited the City of Williams to this meeting and received no response. Chair Babbott requested staff to



*Getting you where you want to go*





# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

involve the City of Williams immediately. Mr. Meilbeck asked if it is really NAIPTA's responsibility. The Board consensus was that since we have been providing this service, there is inherent responsibility to this important constituency, but the City of Williams needs to help fund it. The City of Williams should be involved with the impending decision. Director Keene suggested NACOG should have a role and funds to oversee a plan. Director Putzova said the trend is clearly unsustainable and this program may be the wrong tool to solve the problem as it relates to limited healthcare providers in the Williams area. Mr. Meilbeck stated this is a funding, service and community relations issue. During the recession, NAIPTA wanted to help with mobility efforts in some way. There were some funds from the County and some grant funds available, then came the unpredictable growth. NAIPTA has been successful when the intentions are clear. Chair Babbott reiterated the IGA has not changed and cost recovery will need to be managed. Mr. Kelly stated NACOG would be willing to encourage the Williams discussion. The Area Agency on Aging contributes to Coconino County Community Services. Data on function and purpose should be requested. We still need to figure out where FMC fits in.

Kendra Edens, Coconino County Resident, communicated she is the owner of Williams Taxi and she has been providing this service for approximately 4 years. Most of her clients are on super fixed incomes. The average cost of a taxi ride from Williams to Flagstaff is \$90. They have been accepting the \$30 value of the voucher and not charging their clients the difference. She agreed, medical appointments seem to be the primary reason for her client's trips, then shopping. Shopping options are very limited in Williams. She would like to know who the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) provider is in the area. FMC has a region they provide transport within and she was told Williams is not in it. At one time, only 6 vouchers were offered, which is limited, but better than none. There are some people that do not use their vouchers. Her company can't meet the Arizona Health Care Cost Containment System (AHCCCS) requirements. She was asked if she had a sense of what other companies are doing and described some potential problems. She thought a flat rate versus metered may be helpful.

Dolores Paredes, Flagstaff Resident representing Coconino County Community Services stated they offer a medical shuttle once a week on Wednesdays between Williams and Flagstaff. It is not full every week. NAIPTA will be at the Williams Senior Center on March 3<sup>rd</sup>. She will see about getting someone from the City of Williams there. There is a \$5 suggested donation for the ride. The vehicle has a lift. They can usually include some shopping on the trip.

Chair Babbott stated the Board of Supervisors may be able to add this item to their agenda on March 7<sup>th</sup>. Ms. Morley stated this was a very good discussion. Her plan is to come back to the Board with recommendations in March or April. The public comment period ends in April. Mr. Meilbeck recommended coming back in March with ideas for discussion and then plan to take action in April. NAIPTA plans to apply for 5310 funds, but it is not clear when the application will be available due to the Arizona



*Getting you where you want to go*





# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Department of Transportation (ADOT) being short-handed. The discussion concluded at approximately 11:27am.

7. ANNUAL STRATEGIC WORKPLAN - CONDENSED

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors adopt a condensed version of the annual Strategic Workplan.

Mr. Meilbeck explained the changes he made in the condensed version of the Strategic Workplan. A couple of the items got rolled together. Each item is consistent with the intent. Regarding bullet #7, Director Putzova asked about the developer "buy in". Mr. Meilbeck replied staff has been asked to figure that out. It is a planning effort. The City would need to take action as well. Ms. Mazza gave an example. Two developments are being built on Forest Meadows along Route 10. There are crush loads and we are using an articulated bus to address service. We need to address bus route frequency, etc. in that area. Chair Babbott stated it would be best if this document fit on one page. Vice Chair Overton moved to approve the condensed version of the Strategic Workplan. Director Keene seconded. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

8. CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER (CEO) EVALUATION PROCEDURE

-Veronica Hipolito, NAIPTA Board Secretary

Recommend the Board of Directors adopt a CEO evaluation procedure.

Mr. Meilbeck communicated Secretary Hipolito was not available for this meeting, but she has been working hard on this item. He suggested this item be tabled until she can be in attendance. Director Putzova moved to table this item to a future date. Vice Chair Overton seconded. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

### PROGRESS REPORTS:

16. 5-YEAR PLAN UPDATE

-Erika Mazza, Deputy General Manager

Ms. Mazza stated the Core Design planning process was held for technicians who understand transportation in northern Arizona. Then on each day of the planning event there were briefings for others in the community to attend. Confidential draft maps were received yesterday and they will be brought to the Board at a future meeting.

17. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

- Snow Event

Mr. Meilbeck thanked the City of Flagstaff Streets Department for their efforts during the recent snow event. On Monday, Mountain Line had 7,000 riders versus 10,000, but we still moved a lot of people and ran 80 percent on-time.



*Getting you where you want to go*





# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

- Mr. Meilbeck reported NAIPTA won American Public Transportation Association (APTA) marketing awards for our Proposition 411 Ad Campaign and our K-12 Student Pass Program. Ms. Lenner will accept the awards at a conference in Tampa, Florida.

## ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

Director Keene thanked NAIPTA for offering service during the recent snow storm. NAU did not close.

Chair Babbott mentioned the FMPO Retreat coming up on Friday, February 17<sup>th</sup> and thanked Mr. Meilbeck for taking a leadership role. He stated he has been consumed with the 180 corridor. All the easy options have been tried and now we're at the painful options, trying to determine who pays. We are getting some traction at the State level. There will be a public forum, Grappling with Gridlock on March 30<sup>th</sup>, 6-8pm at the Museum of Northern Arizona. It will be a ticketed event and likely to be a full room. He relayed a legislative report noting transit funding and gas tax discussions having more traction than ever.

### 18. SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

The next Board meeting will be on Wednesday, March 15, 2016 and it will be a WebEx meeting based in Flagstaff in the NAIPTA VERA Conference room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. March agenda items will include but not be limited to the Financial Audit, Budget Message, 5310 Grant Application, Taxi Voucher Program Changes, Employee Satisfaction Survey and an Executive Session for the CEO Evaluation. The March agenda will be available for review on NAIPTA's website and at NAIPTA's public posting places (listed on the NAIPTA website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting, and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the Board.

### 19. ADJOURNMENT -Chair Babbott adjourned the meeting at 11:45pm.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Art Babbott, Chair NAIPTA Board of Directors

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board



*Getting you where you want to go*

