



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Board of Directors Minutes for Wednesday, April 19, 2017

NAIPTA
3773 N. Kaspar Dr.
Flagstaff, AZ 86004

NOTE: IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA BOARD MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

The Board of Directors met in Regular Session on Wednesday, April 19, 2017 at 10:00 am in the NAIPTA Training Room, 3825 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004.

This was a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the Board attended in person, by telephone or internet conferencing. The public was invited to observe and participate in the meeting at the address above.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

Art Babbott (Chair), Board of Supervisors, Coconino County;
Scott Overton (Vice Chair), City Council, City of Flagstaff, acting Chair of this meeting;
Eva Putzova, City Council, City of Flagstaff, left at approximately 12:06pm;
Joanne Keene, Executive Vice President and Chief of Staff, NAU
**Three of our five Board member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*
***The City of Flagstaff holds two seats.*

BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Matt Ryan, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County, alternate;
Charlie Odegaard, City Council, City of Flagstaff, alternate;
Jamie Whelan, Vice Mayor, City of Flagstaff, alternate;
Rich Bowen, Associate Vice President for Economic Development, NAU, alternate;
Colleen Smith, President, CCC;
Veronica Hipolito (Secretary), Dean of Students, CCC, designee

NAIPTA STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager;
Erika Mazza, Deputy General Manager;
Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director;
Jim Wagner, Operations Director;
Jacki Lenners, Marketing Manager
Jon Matthies, IT Manager;
Lauree Battice, Business Manager, left at approximately 10:50am;
Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager;
Kate Morley, Mobility Planner;



Getting you where you want to go

APTA
• 2013 •
NAIPTA

America's
BEST
Transit
System



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Alicia Becker, Transit Planner;
Rachelle Marble, ADA Specialist, 10:13am arrival, left at approximately 10:40am;
Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board;
Fredda Bisman, NAIPTA Attorney (WebEx)

GUESTS PRESENT:

Marlene Carl, County Resident;
Glenn Edens, Williams Taxi, County Resident;
Kendra Edens, Williams Taxi, County Resident;
Howadette Violissi, County Resident;
Shari Peralta, Community Action Advisory Board (CAAB), County Resident;
Vince Soqui, County Resident;
James Carrell, County Resident;
Thomas Soto, County Resident;
Nancy Spriggs, County Resident;
William Spriggs, County Resident;
Don Bigley, County Resident
All guests left the meeting at approximately 12:05pm.

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Babbott called the meeting to order at 10:00am.
2. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS
3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES 3/15/2017

Director Putzova moved to approve the March 15, 2017 minutes as presented.
Director Keene seconded. Vice Chair Overton suggested one correction to change the time of adjournment from 11:35pm to am. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

All members of the public present at the meeting wished to speak to items on the agenda.

CONSENT ITEMS:

All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the Board of Directors to be routine and will be enacted by a single motion APPROVING THE CONSENT AGENDA. If discussion is desired on any particular consent item, that item will be removed from the consent agenda and will be considered separately. All items on the Consent Agenda with financial impact have been budgeted.

5. APPROVE NAIPTA HIPAA POLICY
-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Staff recommends the Board of Directors approve and adopt the HIPAA Compliance Policy as developed by staff in accordance with the requirements of the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 ("HIPAA"), as amended by the HITECH Act of 2009 (ARRA Title XIII). Additionally, staff recommends the Board of Directors authorize staff to make future updates to the Policy changes in staff duties/titles and regulations.

Vice Chair Overton moved to approve item 5 under the consent agenda. Director Putzova seconded. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:

6. FY2017 COUNTY TAXI VOUCHER PROGRAM RECOMMENDATIONS

-Kate Morley, Mobility Planner

Staff recommends the Board of Directors reduce the number of trips offered in the County Taxi Voucher Program to six trips per person per month immediately and continue to monitor voucher rationing to ensure the FY2017 program remains within its adopted budget.

Ms. Morley reviewed a PowerPoint presentation. She explained some of the acronyms and terminology for the public in attendance. NAIPTA is like a co-op. Grants were written for a funding buffer. Use of the program is variable as seen on the graph shown on screen. The average monthly cost is just over \$6000. It is difficult to project. So far, the shortfall has been subsidized by the City of Flagstaff. Ms. Dalmolin was able to clarify specifically the funds come from the dedicated transit tax, due to additional Federal funds received, which are one time dollars in both FY2016 and FY2017. These funds cannot be relied upon for program sustainability. The City Manager of Williams has not responded to our outreach efforts, nor has the City of Williams in general asked to be a part of the program. Approval of new users to the program halted when the budget shortfall was realized. Northern Arizona Council of Governments (NACOG) has not committed to doing anything.

Comments from members of the public followed:

James Carrell, County Resident - He lives in Ash Fork. He is working on commuter bus service along the western I-40 corridor. The name will be Liberty Bus Service for bus, shuttle and medical transportation, running 5 days a week and the fare will be \$10 roundtrip. He also talked about offering bus vouchers by getting Safeway and other businesses to sponsor the vouchers. His primary clientele will be low income individuals.

Shari Peralta, County Resident - She lives in Kachina. She serves on the CAAB. She said she is a huge proponent of the County Taxi Voucher Program and requested to have it continue as is for the next two months. It takes 2 vouchers to travel roundtrip. She sees this as a health issue. She would like to see emergency funds used to keep



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

this desperately needed service. She recommended finding additional sources of funding.

Howadette Violissi, County Resident – She lives in Kachina. She will be 82 in June and she lives on a fixed income. She explained some of her monthly costs and stated she cannot afford to pay a fare for vouchers. She insisted she will walk on I-17, if required.

Vince Soqui, County Resident – He lives in Kachina. He recommended coordinating multiple people taking a taxi at one time. Williams Taxi is not making money. He suggested asking businesses to support the program. He asked about a voucher pool and suggested a transfer of vouchers if some go unused.

Kendra Edens, County Resident – She lives in Williams. She is the owner of Williams Taxi. She was upset and felt like there was a shift in the solution because it was easy. This is personal for her. A lot of her clients have become her friends and she knows they are on fixed incomes and can't afford transportation. She was frustrated that the City of Williams and other taxi companies were not at the meeting. She agreed the current structure doesn't work. In her opinion, the surveys done in Williams are not reflective of the overall situation. She said six vouchers is better than zero.

William Spriggs, County Resident – He lives in Kachina. He said he initially needed all his vouchers due to his health issues. He is healing and he doesn't always use them all, but he still orders all his vouchers because he isn't sure how many he will actually need. There were questions about the voucher reimbursement process. Ms. Morley reported NAIPTA only pays for used vouchers at the metered fare up to \$30 max each. Mr. Spriggs noted this may not be the way it is always done and eluded to the potential of cheating the system. Ms. Morley confirmed if taxi companies are billing inaccurately, then it is fraud. He felt the program dollars should be spent appropriately.

Don Bigley, County Resident – He lives in Doney Park. He said it is safer for him and the entire community by getting him off the road. He pretty much uses all 12 vouchers each month. He said it will be difficult with only half, but he will get by. He asked about cutting the voucher value to \$25, if that might help.

Nancy Spriggs, County Resident – She lives in Kachina. The vouchers and taxi service are very helpful. Some drivers actually turn the meter off if they go over and don't charge the difference. She suggested Veterans Services, mentioning they may be able to help the situation.

There were several questions asked by Board members. Ms. Morley replied that she doesn't think the program would be in jeopardy because our 5310 grant was not funded at the level requested. Approximately 400 vouchers are mailed out per month. If all vouchers were used that would equate to approximately \$144,000 per year or about \$12,000 per month. Based on experience, about 250 vouchers are used per month, so



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

we budget off that number. Chair Babbott stated he carries the Board of Supervisor's input with him. They support continuing service within the NAIPTA boundary. He is trying to get some additional funding so those within the NAIPTA boundary will not have their trips cut to six in the next two months, but no guarantees. Williams needs to be an active participant and pay full cost recovery, if they want to be in the program. Each of the Board members support the staff recommendation. There may still be some future discussion. Mr. Meilbeck stated the City needs to be paid back for funds used toward the County Taxi Voucher Program. Vice Chair Overton moved to approve the reduction in service to all participants in the County program effective immediately as recommended. Director Putzova seconded. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

7. FY2018 COUNTY TAXI VOUCHER PROGRAM

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors submit an FY2018 budget proposal to Coconino County that limits the County Taxi Voucher program to the NAIPTA boundary and establishes a 20% fare.

Mr. Meilbeck reviewed a PowerPoint presentation. NAIPTA is looking forward to July 1st and beyond for a sustainable solution. Some of the issues are: no user fee, this program is unlike all other programs; the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) Shared Mobility Policy, must offer same services to non-ambulatory clients, which require wheelchair accessible vehicles; and NAIPTA has no funds of its own, we operate as a co-op, managing funds from our partners. A map of boundaries for NACOG, Coconino County and NAIPTA was shown on screen. The program structure is not working. A two-part solution is recommended: 1) Limit service to within the NAIPTA boundary and 2) Charge a fare. Most peer programs charge 20-50% of the cost as a fare. The average cost is \$18, so the fare would be \$3.60 per trip. Frustration was noted that shared ride, etc. was not able to be looked at more. Concern was voiced about the same thing happening if ridership goes up. Ms. Morley let everyone know NAIPTA is exploring a PCard system through a bank based on a monthly allocation. The excess could go to next month or next year. This is a policy issue. There does need to be some control. The questions remain as to who, which entity, solves the problem and who takes the leadership role? Per Chair Babbott, medical transport is very underutilized. Per Mr. Meilbeck, NAIPTA can solve the problem within our boundary and would be willing to share our experience. There are still more questions including: Does the voucher amount make a difference? Does the user fee make sense? Should there be a max length to the trip? Can a shared ride be incentivized? There are opportunities for the future. Ms. Morley clarified the PCard system would be a set dollar amount, not necessarily 12 trips. Chair Babbott stated there is opportunity here to put a group together, perhaps CAAB, to look at service outside the NAIPTA boundary. Kendra Edens said that since Williams Taxi will be out of the program, she will have time to work on this effort. It may take some time for the conversations. The PCard payment method should take care of fraud. Howadette Violissi reminded everyone she is on a fixed income. There may be a possibility of looking at income



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

eligibility in populations with inability to pay. James Carrell talked about his partnership with the Taxi Voucher Program. It would be an affordable service. Shari Peralta supported the NAIPTA boundary and stated Williams needs to step up. Chair Babbott explained that everyone in the room knows there is a need and he asked NAIPTA staff to explore a sliding scale for fares. Those who have more means will offset those who don't. Director Keene moved to approve the recommendation as presented. Vice Chair Overton seconded. There was no further discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

8. COUNTY TAXI VOUCHER PROGRAM – CLOSE PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

-Kate Morley, Mobility Planner

Staff recommends the Board of Directors close the public comment period opened January 18, 2017 in relation to the County Taxi Voucher Program.

Vice Chair Overton moved to close the public comment period. Director Keene seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

Mr. Meilbeck noted all other items can wait until next month.

9. PROPOSITION 406 CITY ROADWAY CONSTRUCTION: INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL COMMUNICATION STRATEGIES

-Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager

The Board may take action, but no recommendation is being made.

Due to time constraints, this item was skipped.

10. TRANSPORTATION FUNDING TIMELINE

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

The Board may take action, but no recommendation is being made.

Due to time constraints, this item was skipped.

11. FLAGSTAFF METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION (FMPO) WORKPLAN

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

The Board may take action, but no recommendation is being made.

Due to time constraints, this item was skipped.

12. NAIPTA'S 2017 5-YEAR TRANSIT PLAN UPDATE

-Erika Mazza, Deputy General Manager

The Board may take action, but no recommendation is being made.

Due to time constraints, this item was skipped.



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

PROGRESS REPORTS:

13. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

Due to time constraints, this item was skipped.

Vice Chair Overton made a motion to move into Executive Session at approximately 12:09pm. Director Keene seconded. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Executive sessions are closed to the public.

The Board considered a motion to convene an executive session pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(7) for the following purpose:

1. Acquisition of 5.32 acres of real property adjacent to the NAIPTA Bus Storage Building. ARS 38-431.03(A)(7).

Upon the conclusion of the Executive Session, the Board reconvened the public meeting at approximately 12:32pm.

DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:

14. REAL PROPERTY PURCHASE CONTRACT

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

Staff recommend the Board of Directors enter into a purchase contract for 5.32 acres of land at a cost of \$875,000.

Director Keene moved to approve the purchase contract as recommended contingent on appraisal and due diligence process. Vice Chair Overton seconded. There was no further discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

15. SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

May/June Working Agendas were mentioned by Mr. Meilbeck.

Strategic Workplan was pointed out by Mr. Meilbeck.

The next Board meeting will be on Wednesday, May 17, 2017, 10am-2pm. It will be a Joint meeting with the Transit Advisory Committee (TAC). This meeting will take place in the NAIPTA Training Room, 3825 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004. Parking will be available at the Administrative Office, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004.

Then follow the signs to the Training Room. Please consider carpooling or riding Mountain Line. Your presence is requested in person. Lunch will be served. The



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

public is invited to attend. May agenda items will include but not be limited to the Budget Presentation and Review of the Strategic Workplan. The May agenda will be available for review on NAIPTA's website and at NAIPTA's public posting places (listed on the NAIPTA website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting, and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the Board.

- 16. ADJOURNMENT -Chair Babbott adjourned the meeting at 12:35pm.

Art Babbott, Chair NAIPTA Board of Directors

ATTEST:

Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board



Getting you where you want to go

