



Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

DATE PREPARED: August 11, 2017
DATE: September 12, 2017
TO: Honorable Mayor and Council
FROM: Kate Morley, NAIPTA Mobility Planner
Jim Dickey, NAIPTA Planning Services Manager
SUBJECT: Winslow Transit Plan Draft

RECOMMENDATION:

This item is for discussion and direction; the Council may take action, but no recommendation is being made.

BACKGROUND:

The Winslow Transit Plan (Plan) officially kicked off on January 19, 2017 and established the project mission, "To present a Winslow Transit Plan to the Winslow City Council that is financially viable, operationally specific, supported broadly by the community and effectively meets Winslow's mobility goals."

The draft Plan has been completed and is currently available to the public for comment during the month of September. The contents of the draft Plan are:

- Chapter 1: Project Definition, Mission, Goals and Objectives
- Chapter 2: Existing Conditions and Market Analysis
- Chapter 3: Capital Investment Options
- Chapter 4: Service Alternatives
- Chapter 5: Financial Capacity and Commitment
- Chapter 6: Risks
- Chapter 7: Performance Measures
- Chapter 8: Peer Cities and Winslow Projections

The final Plan will contain two more chapters: Chapter 9, Recommendations and Chapter 10, Implementation.

NAIPTA staff have made three previous presentations to Winslow City Council, one on April 26, 2016, another on February 28, 2017 and most recently on June 27, 2017. At the most recent hearing, staff presented a range of service alternatives for commuter, local and paratransit services (see Draft Report Chapter 4 for more information).

Since that time, ridership forecasts and performance measure with comparatives to peer cities have been developed (See Draft Report Chapter 8). Expenses and revenues for each baseline alternative have also been drafted in Draft Report Chapter 5. Based on those findings, this Council report focuses on recommendations for commuter services and local services for baseline, medium and high service levels.



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

Commuter Services:

The ridership estimate for the Flagstaff- Winslow Route is 8,160 annual trips. Ridership estimated for the Winslow-Holbrook Route is 4,080 trips. For commuter services, the average cost per passenger trip is \$9.49. The average fare for commuter service in peer cities is \$1.11. The average cost per hour for operating is \$59.42.

Based on passenger trips, costs per passenger trip shows that Winslow-Flagstaff has a slightly lower cost per trip than average. Due to low ridership, the Winslow-Holbrook cost per passenger trip are the highest of any service compared. Vanpools provide a very low cost per trip with total 5 year expenses for vanpool at just over \$60,000 versus approximately \$350,000 for commuter bus service. However, vanpools only serve a select group of commuters rather than the general public.

All three service alternatives have low passengers per mile compared to peer communities. However, vanpool performs poorly because six vans are used to transport passengers meaning service miles are very high, creating the poor metric.

Analysis of performance measures for commuter service alternatives shows that vanpool is the most cost effective way to provide service initially. Vanpool only serves regular commuters, however, and may not meet important community goals. The Winslow-Flagstaff commuter bus performs well compared to peer communities in terms of costs though does not have high ridership. Along with performance measures, goals of the system should be considered. Even if low measures are expected, the service may still meet community goals.

Local Services:

Local services have an opportunity to generate much higher ridership, so average cost per trip from peer communities is \$9.53. The average fare for local service in peer communities is \$0.56. However, cost per service hour is slightly less than commuter services at \$54.18 per hour.

Ridership estimates for local service show that the Frequency route would have 23,460 annual trips and the Coverage route would get 26,520 trips. This is because the Coverage route reaches riders who would have no access without the extended service option.

Complementary paratransit (ADA) services have the highest costs per hour because of the highly individualized services they provide, meeting customer needs in terms of time of trip and by providing door-to-door service. The average cost per trip is \$29.86. The average fare for paratransit service is \$3.30. Cost per hour in peer communities is \$67.19. Annual ridership estimates show that Winslow Complementary Paratransit (ADA) trips would be low. This is one performance measure where systems generally want low ridership because the costs are in addition to providing a fixed-route service. Systems often work to make their fixed-route service as accessible as possible by people with a variety of disabilities.

Analysis of performance measures for providing local service is to provide a demand-response system. Ridership estimates for this total 32,640 annual trips, largely in part because the door-to-door service attracts additional riders through convenience.



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

Cost per service hour was the basis for all analysis, so the Winslow Frequency and Coverage routes equal the average of peers. Of note here is that demand-response has a higher cost per hour than fixed-route services. The tradeoff for the higher cost per hour is the higher level of service with door-to-door stops and the ability to meet the needs of customers in terms of time of service.

PRELIMINANRY RECOMMENDATIONS:

	Baseline Investment	Medium Investment	High Investment
Commuter Service along I-40.	Vanpool program for Winslow-Holbrook and Winslow-Flagstaff as can be organized @ \$15k annually	Vanpool plus Flagstaff Commuter Bus Service with 2 round trips per day @ \$85K annually	Vanpool plus Flagstaff Commuter Bus Service with 4 round trips per day and 3 round trips to Holbrook @ \$235K annually
Local Service	Paratransit service for limited population such as seniors and people with disabilities @ \$105K annually	Demand Response service for general public @ \$210K annually	Two fixed routes serving both coverage and ridership alternative locations with complementary ADA service @ \$285 annually

NEXT STEPS

Next steps include:

- Draft report for public review and input (September)
- Develop recommendations and implementation chapters (October)
- Final report (November)
- ADOT Application period (Spring, 2018)

SUBMITTED BY:

Jim Dickey
Planning Services Manager

Kate Morley
NAIPTA Mobility Planner

ATTACHMENTS:

1. Draft Winslow Transit Plan and Appendices available at www.WinslowTransitPlan.com



Getting you where you want to go

