



Transit Advisory Committee Minutes for Thursday, February 1, 2018

NAIPTA Conference Room
3773 N. Kaspar Dr.
Flagstaff, AZ 86004

NOTE: IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA TAC MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM. AUDIO RECORDINGS OF NAIPTA TAC MEETINGS ARE ON FILE IN THE NAIPTA CLERK'S OFFICE.

The Transit Advisory Committee met in Regular Session on Thursday, February 1, 2018 at 10am in a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the TAC attended in person, by telephone or internet conferencing. NAIPTA staff were present in the NAIPTA Conference Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004. The public was invited to observe and participate in the meeting at the address above.

TAC MEMBERS PRESENT:

Dave Wessel, (Chair), Manager, FMPO, (WebEx);
Gillian Thomas, (Vice Chair), Citizen Representative, Coconino County, Chair for this meeting;
James Jayne, Interim County Manager, Coconino County;
Lucinda Andreani, Interim Deputy County Manager, Coconino County, designee;
Barbara Goodrich, Deputy City Manager, City of Flagstaff, designee, (phone), left meeting at approximately 10:38am;
Shari Miller, Citizen Representative, City of Flagstaff;
Erin Stam, Director of Parking and Shuttle Services, NAU, designee, (WebEx);
Ron Hurlle, Chief Innovation Officer/Vice President, CCC, (WebEx);
T. Paul Thomas, Business Representative, Northern Arizona Leadership Alliance;
**Five of our eight TAC member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

TAC MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Josh Copley, City Manager, City of Flagstaff;
Paul Wagner, Citizen Representative, City of Flagstaff, alternate;
Martin Ince, Multi-Modal Planner, FMPO, alternate;
Tim Kinney, Business Representative, Northern Arizona Leadership Alliance, alternate

NAIPTA STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager;
Erika Mazza, Deputy General Manager;
Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director;
Jacki Lenners, Marketing Manager;
Wade Forrest, Facilities Manager;
Lauree Battice, Business Manager;
Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager;





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Kate Morley, Mobility Planner;
Estella Hollander, Associate Planner;
Kyle Marshall, Associate Planner;
Robert Martinez, Technical Specialist;
Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board

GUESTS PRESENT:

None.

1. CALL TO ORDER -Vice Chair Gillian Thomas called the meeting to order at 10:01am.
2. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS
3. APPROVE TAC MINUTES FROM 1/4/2018

Advisor Andreani moved to approve the minutes from January 4, 2018. Advisor Miller seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

There were no members of the public present. Mr. Meilbeck took a moment to congratulate James Jayne on his Interim County Manager appointment and Lucinda Andreani on her Interim Deputy County Manager appointment.

5. REVIEW OF THE DRAFT BOARD BUSINESS AGENDA

The TAC reviewed the draft board business agenda and discussed staff reports, in order to provide recommendations to the Board. Specific comments and recommendations are noted in these minutes.

a. CONSENT ITEMS:

There were no items for the consent agenda.

b. DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:

- i. SECTION 5310 APPROVAL OF APPLICATION AND EXECUTION OF CONTRACT

-Kate Morley, Mobility Planner

Staff recommends the Board of Directors: 1) Authorize staff to submit application to the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT); and 2) Execute the contract of award for Section 5310 funds from the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) through ADOT for the continuation of the Mobility Management, Taxi Voucher Programs, ADA Plus Operations.

Ms. Morley stated this grant benefits seniors and persons with disabilities. NAIPTA applies each year and has been fairly successful at receiving these funds. The funds



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

will go toward mobility management, taxi vouchers and our ADA Plus program. The TAC was supportive of this grant application and execution of contract.

ii. SECTION 5311 APPROVAL OF APPLICATION AND EXECUTION OF CONTRACT

-Kate Morley, Mobility Planner

Staff recommends the Board of Directors: 1) Authorize staff to submit application to the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT); and 2) Execute the contract of award for Section 5311 funds from the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) through ADOT for the continuation of the vanpool program and to expand transit service along US 180 related to winter congestion.

Ms. Morley reported this grant is for rural areas and it currently funds our vanpool program. This grant is on a 2-year cycle. Staff plans to leverage Arizona Snowbowl dollars to potentially double the program. These funds can help with the Highway 180 Implementation Plan as well. There were questions about running buses when not much snow on the mountain, the future bus stop at the base of Snowbowl and the County match. Mr. Morley replied that the Arizona Snowbowl is open and operating and Mountain Express is providing service to build ridership. The bus stop at the base of Snowbowl Road will be paid for by the Arizona Snowbowl so there is no cost to our partners. The County match is \$12,000 per year for two years, due to the 2-year grant cycle. This is consistent with previous budget requests. The TAC was supportive of this grant application and execution of contract.

iii. MILL TOWN LETTER TO CITY MANAGER'S OFFICE

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors consider sending a letter to the Flagstaff City Manager's office regarding NAIPTA's perspective on the proposed Mill Town development.

A handout update to the staff report and the draft letter were distributed to TAC members. Mr. Meilbeck stated this public/private partnership began in 2013. The map on page 18 in the agenda packet was shown on screen in color. He stated this is a complex project. NAIPTA supports this project. There is high frequency transit in the area. High density housing works well with transit. Advisor Goodrich was able to confirm a bike and pedestrian underpass is still part of the project. Mr. Meilbeck admitted this is an assertive way of engaging NAIPTA in the project. He read the University Avenue excerpt from the letter. Advisor Miller suggested the definition of success be considered if a trial is done with bus only lanes. Mr. Meilbeck confirmed this will involve the articulated 60-foot buses. Advisor Andreani expressed concern about a single lane roundabout in the area and recommended looking at that configuration again knowing articulated buses will be used. Chair Wessel stated he will confirm with the city engineer that articulated buses were considered in the single lane roundabout evaluation. Chair Wessel and Advisor Goodrich have not seen the Traffic Impact Analysis (TIA) yet, but it should provide detailed traffic projections at the intersections involved. The Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) is another partner in this project and the City needs to see their Milton study results when it is completed. Mr. Meilbeck read the Beulah Boulevard excerpt from the



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

letter. This is a totally different scenario. Bus pullouts are a big question for transit all over the country right now. NAIPTA can potentially bring funding to the table, but does not want to federalize the project, which adds additional review time and costs about 20 percent more. Advisor Goodrich is open to building bus only lanes from the start, if partners can find a way to fund it. The TAC was overall supportive of sending the letter to the City Manager with the addition of a definition of success for a bus only lanes trial.

Advisor Goodrich left the meeting at approximately 10:38am.

iv. US 180 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN UPDATE

-Kate Morley, Mobility Planner

This item is for discussion only with no recommendation being made at this time.

Ms. Morley reviewed a PowerPoint presentation with TAC members. She went through the deliverables. In the second bullet under legal authority, Chair Wessel questioned the word choice "abandon". He said there is precedent for transferring roads or sections of roads to the City or the County. Ms. Morley stated she would look at the legal language again. Vice Chair Gillian Thomas thought this option should remain on the table for now. Advisor Andreani noted there should be support services in place near the chosen alternative route due to steep grades if people get stuck in snow or ice. Perhaps segment out 4-wheel drive vehicles versus 2-wheel drive vehicles. Ms. Morley said County and Forest Service staff have been very helpful. She reported the Request for Proposal (RFP) for the statistically valid survey was awarded to Moore and Associates. It was decided to remove visitors from the survey as it would be more difficult to collect and validate their responses. There was no further discussion.

v. TRANSPORTATION DECISION 2018

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

This item is for discussion only with no recommendation being made at this time.

Mr. Meilbeck informed the TAC members that the NAIPTA Board directed him to ask for a one-tenth cent for operations in addition to capital funds that may be in the renewal. Advisor Andreani is on the commission. NAIPTA is good through 2030; no needs, but we have dreams. Transportation has capital needs. This is a clear and transparent way to ask if the community wants more transit. Ms. Mazza will present to the commission this coming Monday. She will answer #5 on our Strategic Workplan, "How and when would Mountain Line service improve with increased funding" by developing a specific prioritization and timeframe for voter education. Chair Wessel confirmed the commission has spent quite a bit of time on education of needs and now they will look at projects to be considered. Advisor Andreani recommended finding the overlaps regarding specific projects. Several other studies are in process, i.e. the ADOT Milton Corridor study. They need to understand capital versus operations. Figure out the timing and choose priorities. She felt the J. W. Powell study is an important piece and that study is still in process as well. Overall, the TAC concluded that transit needs to be a part of the system.



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

vi. UPDATE – GENERAL CONSULTING SERVICES CONTRACT

-Erika Mazza, Deputy General Manager

Staff does not have a specific recommendation. NAIPTA Board of Director's may discuss and provide direction.

Ms. Mazza noted AECOM was awarded this contract last fall. AECOM has a long history of working with the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) on transit projects. NAIPTA has lots of projects and staff needed some help. She reviewed each task order and communicated some savings in some areas. The Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) task order is pending due to the ADOT Milton study which is currently underway. We will wait to see what that study determines. Chair Wessel recommended she place titles next to the written descriptions of each task order number lined out on page 2, since the table is on the preceding page, for ease of reference. There were no other comments from the TAC.

vii. NAIPTA ADMINISTRATION REMODEL – UPDATE

-Wade Forrest, Facilities Manager

This item is for discussion only with no recommendation being made at this time.

Mr. Forrest reviewed a PowerPoint presentation with the TAC. NAIPTA has had an increase in office staff positions, from 26 to 36, since moving into this building. This remodel will allow for an increase of another four positions, if needed in the future. NAIPTA was successful in securing a grant for this purpose. A color-coded floor plan was reviewed regarding space conversion. The project timeline was reviewed. A construction RFP is underway and a contract should go to the Board for approval in March. He confirmed this is strictly a renovation of existing space, no additions. There was no discussion.

viii. NAIPTA – FLAGSTAFF METROPOLITAN PLANNING ORGANIZATION (FMPO) EXCHANGE OF FUNDS

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors authorize staff to exchange \$255,000 in Transit tax funding for \$255,000 of Surface Transportation Block Grant (STBG) funding from the Flagstaff Metropolitan Planning Organization (FMPO).

Ms. Dalmolin reported NAIPTA has accepted FMPO unobligated funds for immediate use in the past. NAIPTA is ready to accept funds, and this time, exchange the dollar amount with the FMPO for transit tax dollars. This exchange preserves the funds for the FMPO to use for projects that were delayed and not have to return the funds to FTA. Chair Wessel is grateful to NAIPTA for this option. He found a planning line item that was left unobligated, so the amount needs to be amended and increased to \$283,000 for the Board meeting. It is important to preserve these funds for Flagstaff. There were no questions.



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

c. PROGRESS REPORTS:

i. COST OF TURNOVER

-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director

Ms. Dalmolin provided detailed calculations in specific areas involved in turnover, as seen in a chart on screen: Cost to Hire Someone, including all behind the scenes costs for 4 weeks, Training Costs for 6-8 weeks, 90 percent of operators hired have no Commercial Driver's License (CDL) and zero experience, Morale and Overtime, need to fill vacated positions. It works out to be approximately \$23,000 per vacancy, based on about one year to achieve proficiency. In 2017, with 15 leaves, that is an approximate cost of \$345,000. Advisor Paul Thomas asked if this was artificially high. Ms. Dalmolin stated this is not what the organization would save if no turnover. These numbers are based on full-time, voluntary leaves. In 2015, turnover was at about 20 percent and currently it is at about eight percent. Mr. Meilbeck reminded the TAC that an operations restructure was done in early 2015, a major shift in organizational culture, and some operators did not like it. A significant cost savings was gained with the efficiencies implemented. Staff was asked to consider the question, if pay is too low, how does it relate to turnover? It was also recommended for staff to look at what operator vacancy rates are. Advisor Stam stated turnover has a significant impact on an organization. It is very important to find ways to improve turnover rates. Advisor Andreani recommended considering the issues of compensation with the erosion of wages in a high cost of living area and the need to be competitive. There were no other comments from the TAC.

ii. CEO SUCCESSION PLAN CONTRACT AND SCHEDULE

-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director

Ms. Dalmolin reviewed a PowerPoint presentation with TAC members. An RFP was done, and a contract awarded to Burns, HRL and Lancaster. NAIPTA received several responses, but only one response that addressed all our needs. The areas of need were determined to be: completing a needs assessment, the search effort and transition training. She stated the process is on track and all involved agree there is a lot of room in the timeline, even if a second search had to be done. Overall, the TAC felt it is important to invest in the process.

iii. 2ND QUARTER PERFORMANCE REPORT AND FUND BALANCE REPORT

-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director

Ms. Dalmolin reviewed a PowerPoint presentation with the TAC. Mountain Line was 92 percent on time and Mountain Lift was 98 percent on time, including ADA Plus services. Mountain Line is projected to be at 99 percent of budget, but ridership is currently up 13 percent. Mountain Lift service is more efficient in recent years. The City Taxi Voucher Program is strong. The County Taxi Voucher Program is declining. This was expected with the service area being decreased. There has been a change in methodology. Vanpools were in greater demand last year and Ms. Morley is looking into why demand has changed. Our Peer Comparison is positive.



Getting you where you want to go





Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

Data used from other agencies is from FY2015, the most current available. The Fund Balance looks strong through FY2027. There were questions about on-time performance and what impact the downtown parking plan is having on ridership, particularly in January, when the students are gone half the month. Ms. Dalmolin attributed the on-time performance of Mountain Line to construction impacts. Ms. Mazza stated the ridership data is collected in aggregate and can be analyzed by boardings and alightings in the downtown area. Mountain Link ridership is up and attributable to the articulated buses. Not as many students are being left behind. Staff could dig deeper and look at stop by stop downtown to see if the parking program is having an impact.

iv. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Jeff Meilbeck, CEO and General Manager

Mr. Meilbeck didn't have any current events to report, but he did take the time to thank TAC members for attending the meeting and their engagement on the important topics discussed. It allows staff to keep things moving forward.

ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

Chair Wessel thanked Vice Chair Gillian Thomas for chairing the meeting since she was attending the meeting in person and he was attending the meeting via WebEx.

6. SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

March/April Working Agenda
Strategic Workplan

The next TAC meeting will be March 1, 2018 and will be a WebEx meeting based in Flagstaff in the NAIPTA VERA Conference room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. March agenda items will include, but not be limited to the Financial Audit, Budget Process, CEO and General Manager Evaluation and the Employee Satisfaction Survey. The March agenda will be available for review on NAIPTA's website and at NAIPTA's public posting places (listed on the NAIPTA website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the TAC.

7. ADJOURNMENT

-Vice Chair Gillian Thomas adjourned the meeting at 11:42am.

Dave Wessel, Chair of the NAIPTA Transit Advisory Committee

ATTEST:

Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board



Getting you where you want to go

