



## Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

### Transit Advisory Committee Minutes for Thursday, December 5, 2019

**NOTE:** IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA TAC MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM. AUDIO RECORDINGS OF NAIPTA TAC MEETINGS ARE ON FILE IN THE NAIPTA CLERK'S OFFICE.

The Transit Advisory Committee met in Regular Session on Thursday, December 5, 2019 at 10:00am in a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the TAC attended in person, by telephone or internet conferencing. NAIPTA staff were present in the NAIPTA Training Room, 3825 N. Kaspar Dr., (Parking at 3773 N. Kaspar Dr.), Flagstaff, AZ 86004. The public was invited to observe and participate in the meeting at the address above.

#### *TAC MEMBERS PRESENT:*

Gillian Thomas, (Chair), Citizen Representative, Coconino County;  
Erin Stam, (Vice Chair), Director of Parking and Shuttle Services, NAU, designee;  
Lucinda Andreani, Deputy County Manager, Coconino County, designee, arrival at approximately 10:04am;  
T. Paul Thomas, Business Representative, Northern Arizona Leadership Alliance;  
Kurt Stull, Executive Director of Facilities and Security, Coconino Community College, designee;  
Dave Wessel, Manager, FMPO, (WebEx);  
Jeff Bauman, Traffic Engineer, City of Flagstaff, alternate, (WebEx);  
Mystery-Lynn Freitas, ASNAU Chief of Staff, NAU, designee, (WebEx)  
*\*Five of our eight TAC member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

#### *TAC MEMBERS EXCUSED*

Shane Dille, Deputy City Manager, City of Flagstaff, designee;  
Paul Wagner, Citizen Representative, City of Flagstaff;  
Kevin Parkes, Citizen Representative, City of Flagstaff, alternate

#### *NAIPTA STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:*

Jim Wagner, Operations Director;  
Kate Morley, Development Director;  
Jacki Lenner, Marketing and Communications Manager;  
Wade Forrest, Facilities Manager;  
Jon Matthies, IT Manager;  
Lauree Battice, Business Manager;  
Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager;  
Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner;  
Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner;  
Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

#### *GUESTS PRESENT:*

None.



*Getting you where you want to go*





# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Thomas called the meeting to order at approximately 10:02am.

2. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS

3. SAFETY MINUTE

Mr. Forrest recommended checking smoke and carbon monoxide detectors and to change the batteries annually. He also provided holiday decorating safety tips.

4. APPROVE TAC MINUTES 11/7/2019

Vice Chair Stam moved to approve the minutes from November 7, 2019. Chair Thomas seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Gillian Thomas	X	
Erin Stam	X	
Dave Wessel	X	
Kurt Stull	X	
Lucinda Andreani	X	
Paul Thomas	X	
Jeff Bauman	X	

5. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

There were no members of the public interested in speaking.

6. REVIEW OF THE DRAFT BOARD BUSINESS AGENDA

The TAC reviewed the draft Board Business Agenda and discussed staff reports, in order to provide recommendations to the Board. Specific comments and recommendations are noted in these minutes.

**a. DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:**

- i. UPDATE ON THE FARE STRATEGIES STUDY

-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Battice provided an update on behalf of Ms. Dalmolin. She reviewed a PowerPoint slide and noted the project is near completion. The assessment of peers and conditions has been finished. A draft report with proposed changes has been received. Staff are reviewing the contractor's recommendations to develop a priority list and timeline based on risk, cost and impact. Chair Thomas asked what issues are challenging us. Ms. Battice replied some issues are related to accepting cash by



*Getting you where you want to go*





## Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

operators in general and on-board pass loading. Ms. Morley added, “Anything to reduce dwell time.” Ms. Battice noted we don’t offer back door loading. There were no further questions.

### ii. UPDATE ON AMERICAN PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION ASSOCIATION’S (APTA’S) PEER REVIEW

-Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Mr. Wagner presented this item on behalf of Ms. Mazza. He reviewed PowerPoint slides with the TAC. Three industry executives and a representative from APTA came to Flagstaff in late August for the peer review. Interviews were conducted with staff from all divisions. They toured our facilities and rode routes 2, 3, 4 and 10. They were very impressed with our system and have implemented some of our best practices in their organizations. Under Operations, they looked at our structure, systems and processes, scheduling, performance evaluations, recruitment and retention. The biggest difference is that all three of their agencies are unionized. He stated his takeaway was regarding ongoing recruitment. Their organizations always have an ad in the paper, and they train their employees immediately after hire. He has tried this method and it works. Under Financial, they discussed our Tax Initiative, Budget Efficiency, and Partnerships; especially partnerships with Northern Arizona University. Under General Administration, they evaluated our Workloads and Meeting Efficiencies. Leadership Team meetings have become more work oriented as opposed to updates and we are currently addressing policies and procedures. Overall, this was a very positive experience. Staff will evaluate the recommendations. Advisor Thomas asked if there was a business reason for doing the peer review, perhaps greater access to grants or something. Ms. Morley responded it was done to see what we could learn. There was no Federal Transit Administration (FTA) requirement. Advisor Wessel felt this review was well done; the report reflects well on Mountain Line. He commented that there was feedback offered to act on and he expects it will be done. There was no further discussion.

### iii. UPDATE ON BUS RAPID TRANSIT PROJECT

-Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Collins reviewed PowerPoint slides with the TAC. Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) is a toolbox of transit enhancements. She provided examples. The question is, “What tools or combination of tools make sense in certain areas?” Stakeholders evaluated the 3.2-mile corridor from Flagstaff Medical Center (FMC) to Woodland Village. Specific criteria were used to measure the alternatives, based on five goals: Enhance, Connect, Develop, Thrive and Sustain. Six northern and four southern options were considered. A map of the highest-ranking alternatives was shown. The recommended alternative for the northern section is north on San Francisco Street and then south on Beaver Street. The recommended alternative for the southern



*Getting you where you want to go*





## **Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority**

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

section is bus only lanes on Milton Road for one mile between the Downtown Connection Center (DCC) and University Drive, then bus only lanes for one mile on Beulah Boulevard between University Drive to Woodlands Village Boulevard, then turn around. There will be another stakeholder workshop on December 11<sup>th</sup>. There will need to be coordination with the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) Milton Corridor Master Plan (CMP). Staff feel public support will be needed. She asked for feedback on targeting public outreach efforts. Advisor Andreani recommended presenting to the County Board of Supervisors and said she would think about any commission presentations that would be of benefit. Vice Chair Stam asked to add the NAU/NAIPTA Quarterly meeting to the list. They are a group of administrators versus the Transportation Action Team being a group of volunteers. Ms. Andreani suggested to present to mobility groups and get into networks. Advisors Wessel and Bauman can see the list and confirmed they thought it was pretty comprehensive. Advisor Wessel asked about coordination with ADOT on the Milton CMP and what is the expected outcome of the December 11<sup>th</sup> meeting. Ms. Collins replied that ADOT has been invited to join staff at the presentations to the targeted community groups. She also reported there was an open house in August with approximately 10 attendees, and she plans to present the opportunities and challenges brought forth to stakeholders. Ms. Morley also noted there will be discussion regarding the turnaround at Woodlands Village. Ms. Collins also asked if there were any initial thoughts on the BRT. Chair Thomas stated her concern regarding the lack of pedestrian crossings on Milton Road. Ms. Collins gave an overview of improvements that would be done with the BRT related to pedestrian crossings and noted ADOT will be encouraged to address more crossings in their master plan. Ms. Morley noted that our focus will be on crossings for bus stops or stations but ADOT CMP will look at others. Advisor Andreani thought that should improve safety on Milton Road. Ms. Morley asked Advisor Bauman to provide an update on the Mill Town pedestrian crossing. Advisor Bauman stated this particular bike and pedestrian crossing will be done with the Beulah/University Drive alignment. It will be a tunnel with an urban trail width. Advisor Andreani suggested using science as this discussion progresses regarding the volume of traffic. Communicate the future growth and support it with the data. Flexibility is needed for the long term. This is part of a system. Chair Thomas stated it is a social responsibility. Advisor Andreani stated there is a propensity for a negative reaction, but if the facts and data can be boiled down for public consumption it will help the educational effort. Advisor Thomas stated Northern Arizona Leadership Alliance (NALA) has approximately 50 members who are local CEOs. Ms. Mazza is now a member. She could bring members up to speed, which should be beneficial. He recommended having the data and facts available to present. Then more presentations may be requested from that one NALA presentation. Vice Chair Stam thought the visual of the bike, car and bus, as well as projected growth data would be good to present. Advisor Andreani stated this is a big effort, like a tax initiative, but people need to understand. Chair Thomas noted while gaining support for the BRT and marketing, we may want to look ahead at Fourth Street, the mall and other corridors that may have future traffic issues. Advisor Thomas commented that it is important to note the problem and how we plan to address it. There was no further discussion.



*Getting you where you want to go*





iv. CONSIDER FUNDING FOR SERVICE PRIORITIZATION

-Kate Morley, Development Director

Staff recommends the Board of Directors provide direction to pursue new funding sources in order to deliver on recently adopted service priorities.

Ms. Morley updated the TAC on last month's Board approval of the service prioritization of projects and their request to bring back the funding discussion this month. She reviewed PowerPoint slides with the TAC including the Future Funding Scenario Map. She reviewed information from the post-election survey results. Mountain Line has a 5-Year Transit Plan and an On-Demand Plan to help guide our efforts. The approved Service Priorities Plan was shown. She reviewed the alternatives and asked for feedback. Advisor Wessel stated the sustainability community did not support most of the propositions; additional education is needed. With the passage of Propositions 419 and 420, and not Proposition 421, it is difficult to build the overall transportation system for all modes without transit. There is a need to keep transit moving forward. Developers need to be included. Transit service is not provided in certain areas, which did not support the tax initiative, and only going to .15% would still not include them. He asked if there is time to provide the necessary education by November 2020. Vice Chair Stam suggested trying to answer the question, "What's in it for me?" Point out the benefits to them. Even if there is not service in their neighborhood, if there is high frequency transit on other streets they use, it translates to a positive impact. Advisor Thomas stated he is on the Airport Commission and they are looking at parking options. The airport has some money to address the problem. He wondered if we have to go back to the voters. Ms. Morley noted this is for operational costs which are needed each year. It may be a bit easier to get partners for capital improvements, but we need to ensure sustainability in order to not have to take away service in the future. Vice Chair Stam mentioned the idea of charging a higher fare for the higher frequency routes; fare zones could be created. Advisor Andreani asked about taking the BRT (\$1.6M) out of the mix. It may be wise to proceed with #1 through #4 and #6, if the BRT isn't ready to go. Ms. Morley stated the timing is a big question for us and she deferred to Ms. Lenner regarding renewals. Ms. Lenner noted our current funding level is approved through 2030 and we would likely want to return to the voters to renew the tax in 2026. Advisor Andreani stated these service priorities would be a new funding request and examples would need to be provided. Explain the consequences and what the tax means to the public. Ms. Morley appreciated the comments. Chair Thomas commented on the need for a Park and Ride for people coming into town as a transition point to bus service. There was no further discussion.

v. FY2020 AND FY2021 MEETING CALENDAR REVIEW

-Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

Staff recommends the Board of Directors review and provide direction regarding the remaining FY2020 meeting dates and approve the FY2021 meeting dates.

Ms. Cashman reported that it is time to review the remaining meeting dates for FY2020 and the new meeting dates proposed for FY2021. The TAC meeting has





## Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

already been cancelled for Thursday, January 2<sup>nd</sup>. There are no other conflicts anticipated for TAC meetings. The Board has two potential conflicts for meeting dates in March and April 2020. We will attempt to confirm quorum for the March meeting that falls during Spring Break each year. The April meeting coincides with the AzTA Statewide Conference Awards Luncheon being held in Flagstaff this year. We will attempt to move the meeting to later in the afternoon on the same day or a week later on Wednesday, April 22<sup>nd</sup>. There will not be a TAC meeting on May 7<sup>th</sup> due to the Joint Board and TAC meeting being held on May 20<sup>th</sup>. The summer recess will coincide with that of our partner agencies with no meetings in July. The TAC was supportive of the meeting dates.

vi. CONSIDER APPOINTMENT OF TAC BUSINESS OR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT MEMBER

-Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board  
Staff recommends the Board of Directors consider appointing a Business or Economic Development representative to the TAC, effective January 18, 2020.

Ms. Cashman noted the receipt of two letters of interest, our incumbent, the President and CEO of Northern Arizona Leadership Alliance (NALA), Mr. Paul Thomas, and the current Interim President and CEO of the Economic Collaborative of Northern Arizona (ECoNA), Gail Jackson. A representative of NALA has held the seat since its inception under the Restated Master IGA. Mr. Tim Kinney was initially appointed in January 2014 and he did not have an alternate. Mr. Paul Thomas was appointed in January 2017 and he appointed Tim Kinney as his alternate. The Board will make their decision at their December 18<sup>th</sup> meeting and Ms. Cashman will notify the interested parties of their decision. There was no TAC discussion.

vii. EMPLOYEE SATISFACTION SURVEY – SEPTEMBER 2019

-Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager  
No action is being recommended, but the Board may direct staff on modifications to future Employee Satisfaction Surveys including survey instruments or methodology.

Mr. Wagner presented this item on behalf of Ms. Mazza. PowerPoint slides were shown. He stated the employee survey is offered twice a year. The survey offering has been changed from January and July to September and March. The reason for the change was to see if the new months may provide more accurate results. There seemed to be higher satisfaction in July with the possibility of a pay increase and lower in January when coming off the holidays and possibly feeling a financial crunch. These results are from the first September survey offered. He explained the trends. He noted the pay plan could not be continued as planned; it was not sustainable. The numbers are trending downward. Vice Chair Stam recommended a wait and see approach. See what the results are in March and next September. Ms. Morley stated leadership would be watching and, in the meantime, leadership is addressing comments as we can. For example, operators have asked to be more involved with service planning and we are looking at how to accommodate that request, as well as pay and organizational communication. Vice Chair Stam recommended posting information in bathroom stalls. Advisor Wessel stated



*Getting you where you want to go*





## Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

NAIPTA has been doing consistent surveys for a long time. He recommended looking further back to see if there are historical situations where there were similar circumstances and perhaps, see how long it took to bounce back from similar results. Advisor Thomas stated that thinking it is pay related is dangerous. He thought that is probably not the case. Mr. Wagner replied that the pay issue was related to the fact Operators did not receive what they were promised in July 2018. Ms. Morley stated there has been another issue identified with communication related to Operators receiving mixed messages from Operations Supervisors versus Operations Managers. Advisor Andreani agreed that communication is challenging. There can be messages lost in translation and employees aren't sure what to believe. She meets with small groups directly. It is also challenging to receive feedback because they need to perceive they make a difference. She recommended looking at the types of questions asked. Staff want to get a sense of belonging. There was no further discussion.

### b. PROGRESS REPORTS:

#### i. UPDATE ON AUGUST SERVICE CHANGES

-Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner

Ms. Collins explained the more significant service changes made in August. Route 7 was split into eastbound Route 7 to Sunnyside and westbound Route 8 going along West Route 66. Both routes go to the Downtown Connection Center (DCC). Few riders were impacted that rode from West Route 66 all the way to Sunnyside, but they are adjusting to the transfer. We are seeing an increase in ridership. There is a slight improvement in the on-time performance. Some other modifications are coming on December 14<sup>th</sup>. Route 2 deviations near BASIS school were reduced from 10 times a day to four times a day and the students and parents are adjusting to these highest ridership times that were kept. Overall there has been success and in some areas and where there has been mixed success, we are still addressing the issues. Advisor Wessel stated staff seem to be pretty in tune with the market and that speaks well to the communication that was done and continues to be done. Vice Chair Stam noted it speaks well to what can continue to be communicated. There were no questions.

#### ii. DELEGATIONS OF AUTHORITY

-Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Morley reported the Board approve the Delegations of Authority resolutions in September and these are the first two actions taken under those resolutions: The Zero Emissions Transition Plan procurement and the Southeastern Arizona Governments Organization (SEAGO) Intergovernmental Agreement (IGA) for training. There were no questions.

#### iii. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager



*Getting you where you want to go*





# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Ms. Morley mentioned the Holiday Party coming up on December 12<sup>th</sup> and asked TAC members to please RSVP to Rhonda as soon as possible. She deferred to the list of current event items in the agenda packet to see if there were any questions. There were no questions.

## EXECUTIVE SESSION (BOARD ONLY)

Executive sessions are closed to the public.

The Board will consider a motion to convene an executive session pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3), (4) and (7) for the following purposes:

1. Discussion and consultation with NAIPTA’s attorney for legal advice and with NAIPTA’s attorney and designated representatives of NAIPTA in order to consider its position and instruct its representatives regarding negotiations for the purchase of real property. ARS 38-431.03(A)(3), (4) and (7).

Following the conclusion of the Executive Session, the Board will reconvene the public meeting.

## ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

7. SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS  
January/February Working Agenda

There is no TAC meeting on January 2, 2020. It has been cancelled due to anticipated difficulty achieving quorum during the holiday week.

The next TAC meeting will be February 6, 2020 and will be a WebEx meeting based in Flagstaff in the NAIPTA Training Room, 3825 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10:00am. The public is invited to attend. February agenda items will include but not be limited to the Revision of the Rules of Procedure and Code of Conduct, Quarterly Performance Report, and Review Performance Measures. The February agenda will be available for review on NAIPTA’s website and at NAIPTA’s public posting places (listed on the NAIPTA website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the TAC.

8. ADJOURNMENT -Chair Thomas adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:35am.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Gillian Thomas, Chair of the NAIPTA Transit Advisory Committee

ATTEST:

\_\_\_\_\_  
Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board



*Getting you where you want to go*

