



## Board of Directors Minutes for Wednesday, December 18, 2019

**NOTE:** IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA BOARD MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

The Board of Directors met in Regular Session on Wednesday, December 18, 2019 at 10:00 am in the NAIPTA Training Room, 3825 N. Kaspar Dr., (Parking at 3773 N. Kaspar Dr.), Flagstaff, AZ 86004.

This was a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the Board attended in person, by telephone or internet conferencing. The public was invited to observe and participate in the meeting at the address above.

### ***BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:***

Jamie Whelan, (Chair) City Councilor, City of Flagstaff;  
Steve Peru, (Vice Chair) Chief Development and Government Relations Officer, CCC, designee, arrival at approximately 10:03am;  
Art Babbott, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County, left at approximately 11:22am;  
Jim McCarthy, City Councilor, City of Flagstaff;  
Daniel Okoli, Vice President Capital Planning and Campus Operations, NAU, alternate, arrival at approximately 10:12am

*\*Three of our five Board member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

*\*\*The City of Flagstaff holds two seats.*

### ***BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED:***

Joanne Keene, (Secretary), Executive Vice President and Chief of Staff, NAU, designee

### ***NAIPTA STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:***

Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager;  
Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director;  
Jim Wagner, Operations Director;  
Kate Morley, Development Director;  
Jacki Lenner, Marketing and Communications Manager;  
Wade Forrest, Facilities Manager;  
Jon Matthies, IT Manager;  
Lauree Battice, Business Manager;  
Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager;  
Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner;  
Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner;  
Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board;





# Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

Mitesh Patel, NAIPTA Attorney, (WebEx)

### GUESTS PRESENT:

Austin Aslan, City Councilor, City of Flagstaff, (WebEx)

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Whelan called the meeting to order at 10:01am.
2. ROLL CALL
3. SAFETY MINUTE

Mr. Forrest reported on the testing recommendations for smoke and carbon monoxide detectors, and he provided holiday decorating safety tips.

4. APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES 11/20/2019:

Vice Chair Peru moved to approve the November 20, 2019 Board meeting minutes. Director Babbott seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Jamie Whelan	X	
Steve Peru	X	
Art Babbott	X	
Jim McCarthy	X	

5. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

There were no members of the public present.

### CONSENT ITEMS:

There were no items for the consent agenda.

### DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:

6. UPDATE ON THE FARE STRATEGIES STUDY

-Heather Dalmolin, Administrative Director

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Dalmolin shared a very brief update on this topic. She stated she anticipates a recommendation to consider an implementation plan in January. She confirms the consultant did not recommend a change the one-way fare of \$1.25. Vice Chair Peru



Getting you where you want to go





asked if the fare changes would impact the budget. Ms. Dalmolin replied that they would, and they would be accounted for in the FY2021 budget. Director Babbott asked what percentage fares are in the operating budget. Ms. Dalmolin explained when the NAU contribution is included in lieu of fares, per the Federal Transit Administration requirement, the farebox return is approximately 24 percent and when it is not included, the farebox return is approximately 17 percent. Director Babbott also asked if there was an incentive to drive ridership utilization at slow times. Ms. Dalmolin stated we don't have peak time fares, as one TAC member suggested, or the opposite to incentivize fares during slower ridership times. Director Babbott said it would be good to look at the lever of fares on how affected at peak or slack demand. There are different strategies to serve different outcomes. Ms. Dalmolin stated she would include that. There were no further questions.

7. UPDATE ON AMERICAN PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION ASSOCIATION'S (APTA'S) PEER REVIEW

-Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Mazza reported this was an internal review of our system by three transit organization executives with knowledge of small systems, coordinated by staff at the American Public Transportation Association (APTA). The reciprocity is also nice because they could take some of our best practices to implement at their systems. Their main areas of focus were: Operations, Financial and General Administration. Under Operations, they recommended addressing some organizational structure issues related to clarifying Supervisor and Manager authority and streamlining communication. There is also some disconnect between old and new policies and processes which need to be considered. They really liked our cafeteria plan scheduling options for Operators but thought it may be difficult to keep up with when we grow. They also reviewed recruitment and performance evaluation procedures. More information will be brought back at a later time. They offered good suggestions on providing more timely feedback and feedback on an annual basis regarding pay raises, etc. They gave us a lot to consider. They weren't able to do a deep dive into the Financial piece, but still provided worthwhile feedback on a tax initiative with educational focus, budget efficiency considerations in which the team is spending time reviewing, and partnerships. Our partnership with NAU rose to the top as they all have universities in their cities that offer a type of universal access pass (UPASS) and Ms. Mazza addressed that the team is interested in developing additional partnerships. Under General Administration, they reviewed workloads and meeting efficiencies. She was appreciative of the team, knowing they are all from more established systems. There are different dynamics when trying to grow a system, but we still need to keep work manageable and make sure meetings are productive. Vice Chair Peru mentioned he was impressed by the broad scope of the peer review. Ms. Mazza stated she participated in peer review, as a reviewer, in Ann Arbor, Michigan and she understood





the benefits of the peer review. Director McCarthy commented on this being a win/win for all involved. Chair Whelan noted how staff put themselves in a vulnerable position by taking on this peer review and she appreciated staff doing so to make potential improvements.

**8. UPDATE ON THE BUS RAPID TRANSIT PROJECT**

-Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Collins stated the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) project was brought forward to combat congestion, link activity centers, and the ability to offer reliable, convenient transit service. Stakeholders evaluated the BRT corridor alternatives over the last year and have narrowed the options to one alternative in each direction. The criteria were measured by five goals: Enhance, Connect, Develop, Thrive, and Sustain. The top-ranking alternatives in the north section are North Beaver Street going south and North San Francisco Street going north. In the south section, Milton Road and Beulah Boulevard are preferred. Stakeholders recommend these alternatives go to the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) to include in the Milton Corridor Master Plan. Both of our top-ranking alternatives are moving forward in ADOT's Milton Corridor Master Plan Tier 3 Analysis. Chair Whelan asked if shared lanes should be painted differently. Ms. Collins noted that would be considered. Director McCarthy stated that if cars can share the bus only lanes for right turns, that may be more palatable to the public. Ms. Mazza noted bikes can also share the lane. There was a discussion about which alternatives are best for bikes and pedestrians, as well as pros and cons for right side boarding (right lane boarding), left side boarding (center lane boarding) or scissoring. The next steps are targeted outreach and continuing to work with ADOT on the Milton Corridor Master Plan. Other items to consider are bus station locations, termini loops and environmental analysis. Ms. Collins asked if there are any other groups to add to the list for presentations. Chair Whelan suggested student groups and Director Okoli recommended contacting Northern Arizona University's (NAU's) student government. Ms. Collins stated the soonest the BRT would be operational is estimated to be 2023/2024. Outreach needs to be finished and one route agreed upon. Then application for federal funding follows. She is currently meeting with ADOT weekly and looking for balance of modes for the community. Ms. Mazza stated we may need Board assistance to get in front of community groups. Director McCarthy suggested engaging the Sierra Club early. Funding requirements and size of intersections needed were discussed. Director Babbott asked if one of the intersection alternatives could be good for potential light rail in the future and Ms. Collins replied that it could. Vice Chair Peru suggested finding out what the issues have been in Phoenix with light rail, the opportunities and missteps. Ms. Mazza stated there were difficulties for businesses during construction of the light rail; some businesses closed and now the rent is so high some businesses can't stay. Chair Whelan also recommended connecting with the Convention and Visitor's Bureau. There was no further discussion.





9. CONSIDER FUNDING FOR SERVICE PRIORITIZATION

-Kate Morley, Development Director

Staff recommends the Board of Directors provide direction to pursue new funding sources in order to deliver on recently adopted service priorities.

Ms. Morley presented the Future Funding Scenarios Map and the On-Demand Plan Map to visually introduce the discussion. She reviewed the service priorities approved last month based on these plans. She noted the operating costs listed are in today's dollars and they do not account for inflation. She reviewed the current local funding history and new funding alternatives. Per the TAC discussion, transit is stuck, the timing of the next election was questioned, whether we are far enough along in the BRT process was questioned and messaging for a potential ballot initiative has to be focused on education, staff cannot advocate. Vice Chair Peru asked if the BRT is included. Ms. Morley said yes, and one option includes the airport. Operating cost was confirmed, and capital match questioned. Partners may need to help with enhancements along the BRT. Director McCarthy commented that the tax rate is high already. There was a brief discussion about other possible completing ballot initiatives. Director Babbott stated it is already December and time is moving quickly. There should be a discussion of what has changed in the landscape, since we came up short in 2018. There may be a different way to ask questions that wasn't addressed before regarding climate action, emissions, etc. People will make their decision; it doesn't mean we should preclude the ask. Director Aslan felt like there has not been enough of a change to produce support for a tax increase. He asked if some polling can be done. Ms. Mazza stated some money has been set aside for this possibility. In the last go around, there was no new service and the ballot measure failed in the areas south of I-40. Director Babbott noted increasing service may create an operational problem later and he appreciated the alternative service options offered in the On-Demand Plan. There was a discussion about opening other arterials with Lone Tree, and other areas not mentioned in our plans, such as South Fourth Street and future J. W. Powell Boulevard; as well as potential increased voter turnout in 2020 and a potential tax rate amount to request. The consensus of the Board was to have staff do some information gathering and bring it back next month. Ms. Mazza recapped the request for what polling can be done, what we know will be on the 2020 ballot, a reminder of what was bundled in 2018 and what areas did not support Proposition 421 for increased transit frequency. Director Babbott noted the ballot language is probably due in early July.

10. FY2020 AND FY2021 MEETING CALENDAR REVIEW

-Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

Staff recommends the Board of Directors review and provide direction regarding the remaining FY2020 meeting dates and approve the FY2021 meeting dates.

Ms. Cashman noted the January 2<sup>nd</sup> TAC meeting was cancelled due to the holiday week timing and potential difficulty to confirm a quorum. She reviewed the FY2020 dates and asked for feedback particularly related to the March and April Board





meetings in an attempt to confirm quorum. March 18<sup>th</sup> falls during Flagstaff schools' spring break. Vice Chair Peru stated he would not be available. Chair Whelan, Directors McCarthy and Okoli all confirmed they would be available. It was decided the March meeting would remain as scheduled. The April meeting falls on the final day of the AzTA Conference being held here in Flagstaff this year and many staff will be in attendance, as well as the timing conflict with the Awards Luncheon. There was discussion and a final consensus to move the April 15<sup>th</sup> meeting time to 2-4pm on the same day. Rhonda was asked to send the revised calendar invitation. Due to shortness on time, the FY2021 dates were not discussed, but no conflicts were identified. The summer recess is planned for July and coincides with partner agency recesses.

**11. CONSIDER APPOINTMENT OF TAC BUSINESS OR ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT MEMBER**

-Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

Staff recommends the Board of Directors consider appointing a Business or Economic Development representative to the TAC, effective January 18, 2020.

Ms. Cashman explained that Northern Arizona Leadership Alliance (NALA) has held the Business or Economic Development Representative seat on the TAC since its inception under the 2013 Restated Master Intergovernmental Agreement (IGA). Mr. Tim Kinney was selected to serve January 2014-2017 and then Mr. T. Paul Thomas was selected to serve January 2017-2020, with Mr. Kinney as his alternate. We have had two organizations submit letters of interest: Mr. T. Paul Thomas with NALA and Ms. Gail Jackson with the Economic Collaborative of Northern Arizona (ECoNA). There was some discussion about the strategic impact and attendance. Ms. Mazza noted she has been asked to serve on the NALA Board of Directors, which would continue the relationship of our organizations in a different way. There was some concern about Ms. Jackson being the interim head of the organization. Thoughts were shared about the merits of another organization gaining an understanding of transit. Chair Whelan moved to appoint Ms. Gail Jackson from ECoNA to serve as the Economic Development Representative to the TAC. Vice Chair Peru seconded. Director Okoli abstained; he stated he is not familiar with the requirements of this position. Otherwise, all were in favor, none opposed. Motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE	ABSTAINED
Jamie Whelan	X		
Steve Peru	X		
Jim McCarthy	X		
Dan Okoli			X

In the interest of time, Ms. Mazza asked the Board to consider the Job Order Contracting item before getting into the Employee Satisfaction Survey results report. The Board was supportive of this change to the agenda order.





**12. CONSIDER THE FIRST AMENDMENT TO CONTRACT FOR RFP 2019-106 JOB ORDER CONTRACTING SERVICES – HORIZONTAL CONSTRUCTION OF TRANSIT FACILITIES ASSOCIATED WITH BUS STOPS**

-Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors: Approve First Amendment to contracts awarded April 17, 2019 to Kinney Construction Services, Inc. (KCS) and SWP Contracting & Paving that amends the contract term to reflect the RFP 2019-106 term.

Ms. Dunno explained there was a clerical error found regarding the contract term and it needs to match the terms within the Request for Proposal (RFP). Director McCarthy moved to approve the first amendment to correct the error. Vice Chair Peru seconded. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Jamie Whelan	X	
Steve Peru	X	
Jim McCarthy	X	
Dan Okoli	X	

**13. EMPLOYEE SATISFACTION SURVEY – SEPTEMBER 2019**

-Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager

No action is being recommended, but the Board may direct staff on modifications to future Employee Satisfaction Surveys including survey instruments or methodology.

Ms. Mazza reported on seeing the results decrease in several areas. Her sense is that many employees are holding onto the missed promise of up to an 8 percent increase for Operators. She noted Directors do not complete the survey. She reviewed the results and trends. The Leadership Team is actively working on the communication and feedback loop. They are also considering it may be how the question is asked. The Safety Committee can address some concerns. Several comments were received, and they will be addressed in Transit Voice, our monthly employee electronic newsletter. Manager versus Supervisor clarification will be made in future surveys. Vice Chair Peru suggested to make sure staff know they are the organization’s most valuable assets. Compensation can be accounted for, but he suggested looking at other dimensions of feedback. Ms. Mazza stated she plans to capitalize on the positive.

**PROGRESS REPORTS:**

**14. UPDATE ON AUGUST SERVICE CHANGES**

-Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner

**15. DELEGATIONS OF AUTHORITY**

-Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager





## Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • www.mountainline.az.gov

### 16. CURRENT EVENTS

-Erika Mazza, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Mazza asked if the progress report for the delegation of authority was sufficient. The Board had no questions, nor feedback. Ms. Lenners passed out the Mountain Express Schedule and New Year's Eve Coaster. Ms. Morley stated she was excited about the grant for the Downtown Connection Center (DCC) and a wish list was placed on the wall for staff to write down ideas. There is no need for an executive session today. There is no new information to share. We are waiting on a response from the City.

### **EXECUTIVE SESSION - The Executive Session did not take place at this meeting.**

Executive sessions are closed to the public.

The Board considered a motion to convene an executive session pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3), (4) and (7) for the following purpose:

1. Discussion and consultation with NAIPTA's attorney for legal advice and with NAIPTA's attorney and designated representatives of NAIPTA in order to consider its position and instruct its representatives regarding negotiations for the purchase of real property. ARS 38-431.03(A)(3), (4) and (7).

### **ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:**

#### SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

January/February Working Agenda

The next Board meeting will be January 15, 2020 and will be a WebEx meeting based in Flagstaff in the NAIPTA Training Room, 3825 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. Parking will be available at 3773 N. Kaspar Dr. The public is invited to attend. January agenda items will include but not be limited to the Procurement/Purchasing Thresholds, Fare Study Implementation Plan, Mountain Line Advertising Program, Mountain Express/New Year's Eve Service Updates, Social and Behavioral Sciences/McConnell and Campus Entry Updates, AECOM Quarterly Update, Grant/Procurement/Signature Delegation of Authority Updates, and a Possible Executive Session for the Downtown Connection Center (DCC) Discussion. The January agenda will be available for review on NAIPTA's website and at NAIPTA's public posting places (listed on the NAIPTA website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the Board.

### 14. ADJOURNMENT

-Chair Whelan adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:58am.

---

Jamie Whelan, Chair of the NAIPTA Board of Directors



*Getting you where you want to go*





**Northern Arizona Intergovernmental Public Transportation Authority**

3773 N. Kaspar Drive • Flagstaff, AZ 86004 • 928-679-8900 • FAX 928-779-6868 • [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

ATTEST:

---

Rhonda Cashman, Clerk of the Board



*Getting you where you want to go*

