



Transit Advisory Committee Minutes for Thursday, June 4, 2020

NOTE: IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA TAC MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM. AUDIO RECORDINGS OF NAIPTA TAC MEETINGS ARE ON FILE IN THE NAIPTA CLERK'S OFFICE.

The Transit Advisory Committee met in Regular Session on Thursday, June 4, 2020 at 10:00am in a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the TAC attended by telephone or internet conferencing. Mountain Line staff were present in the Mountain Line Training Room, 3825 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004. The public was invited to observe by online streaming.

TAC MEMBERS PRESENT:

Gillian Thomas, (Chair), Citizen Representative, Coconino County (WebEx);
Erin Stam, (Vice Chair), Director of Parking and Shuttle Services, NAU, designee, (WebEx);
Christopher Tressler, County Engineer, Coconino County, alternate, (WebEx), joined at approximately 10:04am;
Shane Dille, Deputy City Manager, City of Flagstaff, designee (WebEx), joined at approximately 10:09am;
Kevin Parkes, Citizen Representative, City of Flagstaff, alternate, (WebEx);
Kurt Stull, Executive Director of Facilities and Security, CCC, designee, (WebEx);
Dave Wessel, Planning Manager, MetroPlan, (WebEx);
Gail Jackson, Economic Development Representative, ECoNA, (WebEx);
Joe Carter, NAU Student Representative, ASNAU President, (WebEx)
**Five of our eight TAC member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

TAC MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Lucinda Andreani, Deputy County Manager, Coconino County;
Paul Wagner, Citizen Representative, City of Flagstaff

NAIPTA STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager, (WebEx);
Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager;
Wade Forrest, Facilities Manager;
Sam Short, Safety Manager, left meeting at approximately 10:15am;
Jon Matthies, IT Manager;
Anne Dunno, Capital Planning Manager, arrived at approximately 10:07am;
Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner;
Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner;
Robert Martinez, Technical Specialist;
Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board;
Mitesh Patel, Mountain Line Legal Counsel

GUESTS PRESENT:

Martin Ince, Multimodal Planner; MetroPlan, (WebEx)





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Thomas called the meeting to order at approximately 10:01am.
2. ROLL CALL
3. SAFETY MINUTE

Mr. Short delivered the safety message regarding employee wellness and the Employee Assistance Program (EAP). He noted this is an unprecedented time as the COVID-19 pandemic continues, and now the country is dealing with the tragedy in Minnesota. For many this means dealing with increased anxiety and fear. There have been new stresses at home and at work. Mountain Line wants to remind everyone employee wellness is paramount to our mission; they are not alone and there are resources to assist them and their families. Employees are encouraged to get the help they need. The number of authorized EAP visits have been doubled through the end of the year for Mountain Line employees.

4. APPROVE TAC MINUTES 3/5/2020

Chair Thomas moved to approve the minutes from March 5, 2020. Advisor Parkes seconded. There was no discussion. A roll call vote was taken by the Clerk. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Gillian Thomas	X	
Erin Stam	X	
Shane Dille	X	
Christopher Tressler	X	
Kevin Parkes	X	
Kurt Stull	X	
Dave Wessel	X	
Gail Jackson	X	

5. TAC AGENDA

- a. **DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:**

- i. ELECTION OF FY2021 VICE CHAIR FOR THE TRANSIT ADVISORY COMMITTEE (TAC)
-Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board
Staff recommends the TAC perform the election of the Vice Chair position and affirm the ascension of current Vice Chair to the Chair position for FY2021, effective July 1, 2020 and ending June 30, 2021.

Chair Thomas noted Vice Chair Stam is willing to ascend to the Chair position, even though the new Rules of Procedure weren't adopted until March 2020. She asked Ms. Cashman to lead the election process for Vice Chair. Advisor Dille thanked Chair Thomas for her leadership of the TAC. Ms. Cashman opened the floor to nominations with no initial response. Vice Chair Stam provided some history of officer terms and noted her decision to lead by example; assuming the Chair position by ascension if TAC members approve. She





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

stated staff make it easy, the time commitment is minimal if you are already attending the meetings, and it is okay to self-nominate. Advisor Parkes stated he would be willing to serve as Vice Chair. Ms. Cashman explained as an alternate, he is not eligible to serve in that capacity. Advisor Dille stated he would be willing to serve if no other members are interested in the position. Ms. Cashman called for any additional nominations. Hearing no other interested members come forth, Chair Thomas moved to accept Vice Chair Stam’s ascension to the Chair position and the nomination of Advisor Dille for the Vice Chair position in FY2021. Advisor Wessel seconded. There was no discussion. A roll call vote was taken by the Clerk. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried. Chair Thomas thanked Vice Chair Stam and Advisor Dille for volunteering to lead the TAC in the coming fiscal year. It was later learned Advisor Parkes had an audio issue; he could follow the meeting, but he could not be heard and Advisor Tressler had a brief computer issue.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Gillian Thomas	X	
Erin Stam	X	
Shane Dille	X	
Christopher Tressler		
Kevin Parkes		
Kurt Stull	X	
Dave Wessel	X	
Gail Jackson	X	

6. REVIEW OF THE DRAFT BOARD BUSINESS AGENDA

The TAC reviewed the draft Board Business Agenda and discussed staff reports, in order to provide recommendations to the Board. Specific comments and recommendations are noted in these minutes.

a. **DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:**

i. PRESENTATION ON THE CITY OF FLAGSTAFF ACTIVE TRANSPORTATION MASTER PLAN AND FLAGSTAFF URBAN TRAILS SYSTEM (FUTS) MASTER PLAN

-Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner

-Martin Ince, City of Flagstaff/MetroPlan’s Multimodal Planner

This item is for information and discussion only.

Ms. Hollander introduced this item on the agenda and its presenter. Mr. Ince reviewed a PowerPoint presentation with the TAC. Audio was dropped at approximately 10:24am, but it was quickly restored. The benefits of biking and walking are equity, mobility, economy, and health. During the pandemic, some streets have been closed, bike sales have increased, and in some places blue sky has been for the first time in years. Biking, walking, and transit help meet City goals. Biking and walking are essential to get to and from bus stops. He summarized the six goals, strategies, and actions. He is close to having the final draft document. The plan is to hold 60 days of public review, offer a public survey and virtual open houses. Then the plan goes to City Council. Advisor Wessel noted MetroPlan becomes an





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

independent organization as of July 1st and Mr. Ince will stay with the City of Flagstaff going forward. This plan will set a solid framework to help on both the public and private sides. Chair Thomas asked if once it is adopted, it would become part of City planning. Advisor Wessel stated it would become City policy and then be integrated into planning and future development. There was no further discussion.

ii. CONSIDER AND APPROVE THE FY2021 PROPOSED BUDGET

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Staff requests the Board of Directors approve the FY2021 Proposed Budget for a total expense budget of \$48,351,176, operating of \$9,508,223 and capital of \$38,842,954.

Ms. Dalmolin reviewed a PowerPoint presentation with the Board: The Proposed FY2021 Budget was compared to the FY2020 Budget and Projections; the Proposed FY2021 Budget by Operating, Capital and Totals by Local and Federal Sources; the Proposed FY2021 Budget Cost by Program compared to FY2020; the Proposed FY2021 Budget breakdown on expected capital expenditures as compared to the FY2020 Budget and Projections; the Compensation Plan was addressed with a revision to increase pay for front line staff and hold in contingency an increase for exempt staff until revenue triggers are met; other key factors related to Operator wages were noted; key points related to the Financial Plan were mentioned; and the City of Flagstaff Transit Tax Fund Balance was reviewed. Advisor Dille said he appreciated the difficult work on staff's part and the thought that went into it. The City is considering a two percent Cost of Living Allowance (COLA) with triggers. This will be based on the economic rebound, which may be slow to trigger. Ms. Dalmolin stated staff have discussed this with the City as Mountain Line is dependent on City transit revenues. Advisor Dille stated the report is very thorough but he wonders what happens if expenses exceed revenues. A one to two percent COLA could be done, with a pause on the compensation plan. Ms. Dalmolin noted there are other alternatives for the Board to consider in the staff report. A one percent COLA will only offset the Northern Arizona Public Employee Benefit Trust (NAPEBT) insurance premium increase and the Arizona State Retirement System (ASRS) increase. Advisor Dille asked several questions related to having a recession plan in place, what do we do if it is worse than expected, could we stem a furlough if the uncertainty continues, etc. He voiced concern about the long term. Ms. Dalmolin replied that other items would be evaluated if a recession continues. Advisor Tressler commented that the County Public Works department is in the same situation with operators. He has an appreciation for wanting staff to stay. Staff need to show how the budget can weather this crisis. He understood Director Babbott's position that something has to give. He recommended adding some slides to show how Mountain Line can weather this, whether it is to thin programs, etc. The County is likely to see a 30-40 percent reduction in revenues. Consider how to make reductions in different scenarios. They use estimates from the state. Show how to support and fund the pay play and there may be more Board support. Advisor Jackson asked to go back to the slide that mentioned triggers. She recommended being more specific as to what the triggers will be, so they are understood in advance. Ms. Dalmolin responded that staff have the triggers identified and she can show them. She thanked TAC members for these suggestions. There was no further discussion.

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

iii. CONSIDER THE FY2021 COLLECTIVE GRANT RESOLUTION AND THE FY2021-FY2025 TRANSIT PROGRAM FROM THE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors: 1) Approve the FY2021 Collective Grant Resolution, Resolution 2021-100, for federal and state transit grant applications and subsequent executions as necessary to support transit programs within the 10-year financial plan; and 2) Approve the Transit Program from the FY2021-FY2025 regional Transportation Improvement Program.

Ms. Dalmolin explained this is an annual housekeeping item brought for discussion and action as it is only the second time bringing it to the Board. There were no questions and no discussion.

iv. CONSIDER PROCUREMENT RESOLUTION 2021-110

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors approve Procurement Resolution 2021-110 authorizing the CEO and General Manager to 1) authorize and award procurements and 2) execute contracts that support projects that are within the approved fiscal year budget, the 10-year financial plan, and which may be related to the approved annual Grant Resolution.

Ms. Dalmolin explained this is an annual housekeeping item brought for discussion and action as it is only the second time bringing it to the Board. There were no questions and no discussion.

v. CONSIDER INTERGOVERNMENTAL AGREEMENT (IGA) WITH NORTHERN ARIZONA UNIVERSITY (NAU) FOR THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE CAMPUS BUS STORAGE FACILITY

-Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors authorize the CEO and General Manager to execute an Intergovernmental Agreement (IGA) with Northern Arizona University (NAU) for the development of the Campus Bus Storage Facility.

Ms. Morley reported the initial agreement with NAU is being brought to the Board for approval. More information would be brought back to the TAC and Board as the project progresses. There were no questions and no discussion.

vi. CONSIDER ADOPTION OF TRANSIT ASSET MANAGEMENT PLAN

-Wade Forrest, Facilities Manager

Staff recommends the Board of Directors adopt the Transit Asset Management Plan.

Mr. Forrest communicated the Transit Asset Management (TAM) Plan is a Federal Transit Administration (FTA) requirement. The qualifying assets that need to be outlined in the TAM Plan are equipment, facilities and rolling stock. A snapshot of our assets was shown in the PowerPoint presentation. We are fortunate to have relatively young equipment, rolling stock averages less than five years old. A snapshot of assets was shown, including the performance targets and measures. We are performing well. Mountain Line has employed

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

proactive management approach. The TAM Plan can be tied to many other policies. The goal is to try to extend the useful life of assets by 50 percent. There was no discussion. Chair Thomas said she saw the advantage to this plan when applying for grants.

vii. DISADVANTAGED BUSINESS ENTERPRISE (DBE) GOAL SETTING FFY2021-FFY2023

-Heather Higgins, Purchasing Specialist

Staff recommends the Board of Directors approve updated DBE goals for FFY2021-FFY2023, based on FTA guidance for goal setting and as adjusted per Arizona Department of Transportation Disparity Study 2020.

Ms. Dalmolin stated this goal was last approved several years ago. Ms. Higgins is still working on the goal setting and it will be brought to the Board later in the month. The Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) Disparity Study is not yet finalized. The goal will be pending public input in July. Historically there has not been any public response. An update will be brought back to the TAC and Board in August.

viii. CONTINUATION OF TERM IN FY2021 FOR CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS

-Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

Staff recommends the Board of Directors affirm the continuation of current Chair and Vice Chair for FY2021, effective July 1, 2020 and ending June 30, 2021.

The TAC skipped this item.

ix. CONSIDER THE ZERO EMISSIONS BUS (ZEB) TRANSITION PLAN

-Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner

Staff recommends the Board of Directors provide staff with direction on the policy tradeoffs between emissions, service provision, and capital costs for the fleet technologies available.

Ms. Collins reviewed a PowerPoint presentation with the TAC. She reported Mountain Line staff are working with Center for Technology and Engineering (CTE) staff on this plan and they are nearing the end of Phase One. She is asking for feedback on Fleet technologies. She reviewed the five options: Depot-Charged, Battery-Electric; Depot and On Route Charged, Battery-Electric; Fuel Cell Electric; A Mix of Battery-Electric and Fuel Cell Electric; and Hybrid-Electric and their descriptions. Policy tradeoffs have been identified and need to be discussed related to emissions, service provision and cost. She noted she does not have all the data yet. The emissions ranking is thought to be true. Arizona Public Service (APS), our electricity provider, has committed to renewable targets. Staff strive to honor the 2008 voter preference for low or no emission vehicles, as well as the City's climate change policy. Advisor Tressler asked if there is a component of study that looks at logistics for our system and costs, as well as if there are different levels that will work best for us. Ms. Collins noted all data points will be received specific to Mountain Line. Advisor Wessel stated that if the graph was normalized to trips it would provide better information. It is no surprise that cars have the highest emissions. Service Provision needs to consider how much disruption there will be to our schedule. Vehicles would potentially need to charge throughout the day and the schedule would need to adjust for disruptions. Under cost, there are three considerations:

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

bus procurement, fueling infrastructure and annual fuel. The bus procurement cost was ranked by cost for the five options and based on funds at an 80/20 split. There will be impacts on financial plans. The first bus replacement is scheduled for 2022. The depot only charging for the Battery-Electric buses would require a larger fleet. The fueling infrastructure cost was ranked and believed to be true. Consideration for fuel cell technology would be on-site generation versus trucking in. The annual fuel cost was ranked, and the depot charged Battery-Electric rose to the top with lower cost due to use of off-peak charging hours. Ms. Collins encouraged TAC members to share feedback. The overall comments from TAC members were that it was difficult to provide feedback with incomplete data. One comparison chart was suggested to show a summary of the data. Some concern was noted regarding significant increased bus cost for marginal improvement in emissions, diminishing return. Ms. Collins stated there may be improvements every few years. Another comment was that the graph ranking did not seem to be a true reflection; the spread between options needs to be noted when all the data is received, denoting the order of magnitude. There was no further discussion.

b. CONSENT AGENDA

All matters under Consent Agenda are considered by the Board of Directors to be routine and will be enacted by a single motion APPROVING THE CONSENT AGENDA. If discussion is desired on any particular consent item, that item will be removed from the consent agenda and will be considered separately. All items on the Consent Agenda with financial impact have been budgeted.

- i. CONSIDER APPROVAL OF SECTION 5310 SUPPLEMENTAL FUNDS APPLICATION FOR \$600,000 AND EXECUTION OF CONTRACT
-Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner
Staff recommends the Board of Directors: 1) Authorize staff to submit application to the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) for Section 5310 Supplemental Funds in the amount of \$600,000; and 2) Execute the contract of award.
- ii. CONSIDER VALUATION FOR FY2021 ANNUAL JOB ORDER CONTRACTING (JOC) FOR HORIZONTAL TRANSIT FACILITIES ASSOCIATED WITH BUS STOPS
-Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager
Staff recommends the Board of Directors authorize Mountain Line CEO and General Manager to execute Job Orders under RFP 2019-106 in an amount not to exceed \$185,000.
- iii. CONSIDER FY2021 TASK ORDERS TO AECOM TECHNICAL SERVICES, INC.
-Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager
Staff recommends the Board of Directors authorize the CEO and General Manager to redistribute prior approved Task Order valuations as FY2021 carry forward in value of \$1,954,526 for AECOM Technical Services, Inc contract.
- iv. CONSIDER RENEWAL OF LINE OF CREDIT FROM WELLS FARGO FOR \$500,000
-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

Staff recommends the Board of Directors authorize Mountain Line CEO and General Manager to renew and activate the Wells Fargo credit line in an amount of up to \$500,000 to provide cash flow assistance if necessary, to meet cash flow commitments during fiscal year 2020-2021.

v. CONSIDER AN UPDATED PERSONNEL POLICY MANUAL

-Danelle Knight, Employee Relations Generalist

Staff recommends the Board of Directors adopt various updates to Mountain Line policies to incorporate changes that reflect both regulatory requirements and Mountain Line's actual practices.

There were no questions regarding the consent agenda.

c. **PROGRESS REPORTS:**

i. NOTICE OF COMPLETION: MILTON CAMPUS ENTRY STUDY

-Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager

There were no questions regarding the progress report.

ii. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Dalmolin had no current events to report. She was asked to relay a message from Human Resources. There will be an executive session at the June 17th Board meeting to discuss the CEO and General Manager position. Comments and feedback should be submitted to Ms. Knight by email or phone call. Advisor Dille asked what feedback the Board is looking for, the process or her performance, etc. Ms. Dalmolin stated she is unsure of what information the Board is looking for at this time. She knows her interim contract expires in August and there will not be another Board meeting until late August. She will ask Ms. Knight to provide more information to them regarding specifics as to what information the Board is seeking from TAC members.

ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

7. SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

August/September Working Agenda

The next TAC meeting will be August 6, 2020 and will be a WebEx meeting based in Flagstaff in the Mountain Line Training Room, 3825 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10:00am. The public is invited to attend. August agenda items will include but not be limited to the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) Goal Update, Annual Cybersecurity Report, Human Trafficking Campaign, Central Yavapai Metropolitan Planning Organization (CYMPO) Service Request, Strategic Plan Updates, Annual Safety Report, Emergency Operations Center (EOC) Update, Pandemic Updates by Department, Maintenance Updates, and Delegation of Authority Update: Agreements, Grants, and Procurements. The August agenda will be available for review

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

On Mountain Line's website and at Mountain Line's public posting places (listed on the Mountain Line website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the TAC.

8. ADJOURNMENT -Chair Thomas adjourned the meeting at approximately 12:00pm.

Gillian Thomas, Chair of the Mountain Line Transit Advisory Committee

ATTEST:

Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

Getting you where you want to go

