Transit Advisory Committee Minutes for Thursday, January 6, 2022

NOTE: IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA TAC MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM. AUDIO RECORDINGS OF NAIPTA TAC MEETINGS ARE ON FILE IN THE NAIPTA CLERK’S OFFICE.

The Transit Advisory Committee met in Regular Session on Thursday, January 6, 2022, at 10:00 am in a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the TAC and Mountain Line staff attended by telephone or internet conferencing. Some staff were present in the Mountain Line Training Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004. The public was invited to observe by online streaming.

TAC MEMBERS PRESENT:
Shane Dille, (Chair), Deputy City Manager, City of Flagstaff, designee, (Zoom);
Dave Wessel, (Vice Chair), Planning Manager, MetroPlan, (Zoom);
Erin Stam, Director of Parking and Shuttle Services, NAU, designee, (Zoom);
Gillian Thomas, Citizen Representative, Coconino County, (Zoom);
Kurt Stull, Executive Director of Facilities and Security, CCC, designee, (Zoom);
Gail Jackson, Economic Development Representative, (ECoNA), (Zoom);
Tiffany Kerr, Health Disparities Program Manager, Coconino County, designee, (Zoom)
*Five of our eight TAC member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.

TAC MEMBERS EXCUSED:
Maylee Acosta, President, ASNAU City of Flagstaff Citizen Representative and Alternate positions are vacant.

STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:
Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager, (Zoom);
Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager, (Zoom);
James Wagner, Operations Director, (Zoom);
Jacki Lenners, Marketing and Communications Manager, (Zoom);
Samuel Short, Safety Manager, (Zoom);
Jeremiah McVicker, Maintenance Manager, (Zoom);
Danelle Knight, Human Resources Manager, (Zoom), joined at approximately 10:09 am;
Joshua Stone, Financial Analyst, (Zoom);
Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager, (Zoom);
Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner, (Zoom);
Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner, (Zoom);
Jon Matthies, IT Manager;
James Olson, IT Technician;
Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board;
Kris Beecher, Mountain Line Legal Counsel, (Zoom)
1. **CALL TO ORDER**
   - Chair Dille called the meeting to order at approximately 10:01 am.

2. **ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS**
   
   Our new County members, Tiffany Kerr and Kim Musselman, each introduced themselves.

3. **SAFETY MINUTE**
   - Sam Short, Safety Manager

   Mr. Short reported “Health is everything.” He noted the United States has some alarming disease statistics. He reviewed some recommendations to improve overall health.

4. **APPROVE TAC MINUTES 11/4/2021**

   Advisor Stam moved to approve the minutes from November 4, 2021. Chair Dille seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>YES VOTE</th>
<th>NO VOTE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Shane Dille</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dave Wessel</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erin Stam</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gillian Thomas</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kurt Stull</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gail Jackson</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tiffany Kerr</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. **REVIEW OF THE DRAFT BOARD BUSINESS AGENDA**

   The TAC reviewed the draft Board Business Agenda and discussed staff reports, in order to provide recommendations to the Board. Specific comments and recommendations are noted in these minutes.

   a. **DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:**

   i. **ELECTION OF VICE CHAIR OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS (BOARD ONLY)**

   - Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

   Staff recommends the Board of Directors elect a Vice Chair for the remainder of FY2022, effective immediately.

   Ms. Dalmolin stated this is a housekeeping item for the Board with elections occurring each year. Ms. Cashman clarified that the Vice Chair ascends to the Chair position; it is considered a two-year commitment. There were no questions.
ii. **UPDATE USER FEES AND ADOPT FARE CAPPING**  
- Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager  
Staff recommends the Board of Directors update the adopted User Fees and approve Fare Capping as a fare payment measure to increase equitable access to reduced monthly fares as available with pre-paid period passes.

Ms. Dalmolin noted she provided a brief history in her staff report. She reported the Fare Strategies study was done a while ago related to mobile ticketing, stored value cards, etc. She explained what fare capping is and what benefit it provides. She stated that mobile ticketing or stored value cards must be used by the rider for fare capping to happen, to track usage in order to give the rider the benefit of the discount offered for period passes. The calculations are all done on the tech side, intended to allow equitable access. Our current fare collection systems can be modified to accommodate this change. She reported fare capping should also reduce cash fares which in turn decreases the time a bus spends at bus stops and the cost of collecting cash. Fare capping is anticipated to increase ridership by approximately three percent in passenger trips, and conversely result in a loss of fare revenue of approximately $50,000 per year. If fare capping is approved by the Board, she stated the effective date of the new user fees would be July 1, 2022 and allow for the FY2023 budget to reflect this change. She reiterated the decreased revenue would be offset by other processes. There was a question about how this would work for someone who needs to take more than one bus to get to their destination. Ms. Dalmolin responded that fare capping requires mobile ticketing or stored value pass and that the fare capping would be built into the solution. She noted it is not for cash only customers; however, cash customers can purchase a stored value card which is reloadable in small amounts and can receive this benefit. She confirmed fare capping will not be for specialty passes that are already deeply discounted such as the ecoPASS and K-12 or College passes, and cash will still be accepted. She added all passes can be reloaded online. There was a concern raised over loss of fare revenue, which can be offset by other processes, such as decreased dwell time at stops, but asked what other steps can be quantified. Ms. Dalmolin replied that there are cash costs versus credit card fees and the time it takes for staff handling cash; even if fare capping is not an equal tradeoff, staff recommend fare capping as a measure of equitable access to discounted fare for regular riders. There was one last question about increased collection efforts in the future. Ms. Dalmolin responded that this is on a pay as you go basis, no deferred payment, and that the technology is designed to calculate fares and timing appropriately. She confirmed that this is being adopted across the industry, with proven capabilities industry-wide. The TAC was supportive of this action.

iii. **STATE FUNDING UPDATE**  
-Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager  
The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Morley reported the pursuit of state funding is supported in the Mountain Line Strategic Plan. She noted Arizona is one of five states that do not fund transit. She stated staff have been working with the Arizona Transit association (AzTA), but other agencies are not quite ready to join the effort. She communicated Mountain Line has hired a Legislative Liaison, The Kruse Group, to assist with this effort. Ms. Morley explained the construction costs for
the Downtown Connection Center (DCC) have escalated, an additional $6 million is needed and Representative Blackman is willing to sponsor a bill to fund this shortfall. She told the TAC that she and Ms. Dalmolin have been meeting with many state legislators to gain support for this bill and all feedback has been positive. She noted talking points are being developed. She stated staff will ask the Board to sign a thank you letter to Representative Blackman. There was a question about what the other four states may be doing to aid transit efforts. Ms. Morley responded, as an example, in Utah the state does a lot of transit projects on its own versus money going to a transit agency. There was another question about coordination with the City and County. Ms. Morley replied that staff are waiting on a bill number at this point; she plans to communicate information to Alliance members at the meeting next week and then get information out to our partners. TAC members recognized the increased costs of projects and were supportive of these efforts.

b. PROGRESS REPORTS:

i. FY2023 MEETING DATES
   -Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

ii. BUS RAPID TRANSIT GRANT UPDATE
    -Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager

iii. GENERAL CONSULTING SERVICES CONTRACT UPDATE
     -Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager

iv. MILTON AND US 180 CORRIDOR MASTER PLANS UPDATE
    -Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager

Chair Dille asked for a verbal update on this item. Ms. Morley noted the Project Manager has left the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) which has presented challenges in completing this project. She explained an issue regarding crossings has been escalated based on planning criteria. The proposed plan calls for crossings near bus stops which is good for Mountain Line. The problem is that when the crossings go through technical evaluation, it’s anticipated they won’t meet the criteria to be built. She stated this conflict needs to be resolved and Mountain Line would like to see acknowledgement for potential waivers, transparency regarding the process, and these evaluations don’t get removed from the plan. Vice Chair Wessel communicated that ADOT has come up with some language for the plan and it is effectively done, and a summary report will go to the MetroPlan Executive Board. He also informed the TAC that Councilmember Shimoni has met with some people from Portland about some possibilities for change based on the industry. In response to a question, Ms. Morley stated the escalation is not done yet; the City of Flagstaff and Northern Arizona University (NAU) have not responded yet.

v. DELEGATIONS OF AUTHORITY
   -Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager
vi. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Dalmolin spoke to some current event items:

- Mountain Line New Year’s Eve service was cancelled due to the Pinecone Drop being cancelled. It was still a fare free day during regular service hours. No complaints were received regarding this cancellation of service.
- Mountain Express service began on December 26, 2021.
- The Temporary standard for Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) has led staff to prepare to put in place a policy of choice, proof of the COVID vaccine or weekly COVID testing. The Supreme Court decision on this temporary standard is expected very soon.
- Four operators recently graduated from training, and we have 5 more operators currently in training; then we should be fully staffed.
- The new Associate Transit Planner is Brody Smith. His expertise in our data world will be helpful.
- A few key anniversaries were announced: Jed Davis, Trainer, 9 years; Greg Mockta, Facilities, 1 year; and Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager, 6 years. She congratulated all employees having anniversaries.
- Chair Dille requested an update on the DCC. Ms. Morley stated the Conditional Use Permit (CUP) was approved by Planning and Zoning in December. The parking reduction plan was also approved. Work continues with the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) on the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) regarding resolution of an issue. Then an intergovernmental agreement (IGA) can be signed with the City of Flagstaff and the project can move forward. The DCC is currently slated to be over budget and solutions are being researched related to state funding and plus ups for transit. Chair Dille recommended this update go to the Board as well.

ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

Vice Chair Wessel would like to present an update on the Regional Transportation Plan for this group in the near future. He will follow up with Ms. Dalmolin and Ms. Morley on timing.

Chair Dille thanked Vice Chair Wessel for agreeing to run the February meeting as he will be in budget meetings.

6. SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

February/March Working Agenda

The next TAC meeting will be February 3, 2022, and it will be a Zoom meeting based in Flagstaff in the Mountain Line Training Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. February agenda items may include but not be limited to FY2023 Budget – Staffing, Bus Stop Rehab Plan, Kaspar Headquarters Master Plan, Mountain Line Go! Quarterly Update, 5307/5339 Grant Opportunities, Service Changes/Planning, Strategic Plan Review, Quarterly Performance Report, and Delegation of Authority Updates. The February agenda will be available for review on Mountain Line’s website and at Mountain Line’s public
posting places (listed on the Mountain Line website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the TAC.

7. **ADJOURNMENT**

-Chair Dille adjourned the meeting at approximately 10:55am.

______________________________
Shane Dille, Chair of the Mountain Line Transit Advisory Committee

ATTEST:

______________________________
Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board