



Board of Directors and Transit Advisory Committee Joint Meeting Minutes for Wednesday, May 18, 2022

NOTE: IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA BOARD MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

The Board of Directors and Transit Advisory Committee (TAC) met in Joint Session on Wednesday, May 18, 2022 at 9:00 a.m. in the Mountain Line Training Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004.

This was a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the Board and TAC attended by telephone or internet conferencing only. The public was invited to observe by electronic means only.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

Adam Shimoni, (Chair), City Councilor, City of Flagstaff, (Zoom);
Tony Williams, (Vice Chair), Dean of Student Affairs, CCC, (Zoom);
Miranda Sweet, City Councilor, City of Flagstaff, (Zoom);
Josh Maher, Associate VP for Community Relations, NAU, alternate, (Zoom);
Judy Begay, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County, alternate, (Zoom), joined at approximately 9:05am

**Three of our five Board member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

***The City of Flagstaff holds two seats.*

BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Jeronimo Vasquez, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County;
Paul Deasy, Mayor, City of Flagstaff, alternate;

TAC MEMBERS PRESENT:

Erin Stam, (Vice Chair), Director of Parking and Shuttle Services, NAU, designee, (Zoom);
Tiffany Kerr, Health Disparities Program Manager, Coconino County, (Zoom);
Kurt Stull, Executive Director of Facilities and Security, CCC, designee; (Zoom),
Gail Jackson, Economic Development Representative, Economic Collaborative of Northern Arizona (ECoNA), (Zoom), joined at approximately 9:07am and left at approximately 10:25am;
Jeff Meilbeck, Executive Director, MetroPlan, alternate, (Zoom);
Judy Manor, Assistant Director of Campus Shuttle Services, NAU, alternate, (Zoom);
Kinsey Kavanagh, VP of Student Affairs, ASNAU, designee, (Zoom)

**Five of our eight TAC member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

TAC MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Gillian Thomas, Citizen Representative, Coconino County;
Dave Wessel, (Chair), Manager, MetroPlan;





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

Greg Clifton, City Manager, City of Flagstaff;
Jeff Bauman, Traffic Engineer, City of Flagstaff, alternate;
Kim Musselman, Health and Human Services Director, Coconino County, alternate;
Brendan Trachsel, President, ASNAU, alternate

NAIPTA STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager, (Zoom);
Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager, (Zoom);
Jacki Lenners, Marketing and Communications Director, (Zoom);
Sam Short, Safety Manager, (Zoom), joined at approximately 9:03am;
Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager, (Zoom);
Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner, (Zoom);
Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner, (Zoom);
Heather Higgins, Purchasing and Contract Officer, (Zoom), joined at approximately 9:03am;
Jon Matthies, IT Manager;
Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board;
Scott Holcomb, Mountain Line Attorney, (Zoom);

GUESTS PRESENT:

Cheryl Barlow, District Director for District 4 Supervisor Judy Begay, (Zoom), left at approximately 10:13am;
Linda Curley, Community Liaison for District 4 Supervisor Judy Begay, (Zoom and Phone), 928-220-5936, joined at approximately 9:05am and left at approximately 10:44am;
Rick Tadder, Management Services Director, City of Flagstaff, joined at approximately 9:05am and left at approximately 10:36am;
Barney Helmick, Airport Manager, City of Flagstaff, joined at approximately 10:25am

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Shimoni called the meeting to order at approximately 9:02 a.m.
2. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS
3. SAFETY MINUTE
-Sam Short, Safety Manager

Mr. Short reported May 23-27 has been designated Arizona Heat Awareness Week by the Governor. He shared that extreme heat could cause heat exhaustion or heat stroke; be sure to drink plenty of water as well as a sports drink with electrolytes and take breaks in the shade or indoors.

Getting you where you want to go





DISCUSSION ITEMS:

4. FY2023 BUDGET PRESENTATION

-Josh Stone, Management Services Director

Ms. Dalmolin presented on behalf of Mr. Stone. She reviewed Mountain Line's funding sources and a chart with the breakdown of operating and capital by revenue source. She shared the fund balance graph. She did point out that the budget does not include funding to continue microtransit beyond the pilot program, nor does it reflect the potential State revenue for the Downtown Connection Center. Ms. Dalmolin noted the fund balance is healthy for the future at current service levels. Mr. Meilbeck commented that the fund balance is very healthy and sustainable. He asked about performance metrics. Ms. Dalmolin stated staff are working through Flagstaff in Motion right now and hoping to adopt new performance measures when the five year plan is completed. There was no further discussion.

5. FLAGSTAFF IN MOTION, A COMMUNITY TRANSIT PLAN

-Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner

Ms. Collins stated staff have been in negotiations with the consultant team and Ms. Dalmolin has approved a contract modification. Ms. Collins noted staff would complete the plan. She informed Board and TAC members of the project status, currently at Stage 3, #3 Public Involvement. She noted local presentations have been done recently. She shared she is working with W.L. Gore and Associates on a commuter survey, and also plans to work with Purina on a survey. She noted she is looking into other possible business interests through the Economic Collaborative of Northern Arizona (ECoNA). There was a brief discussion about reaching out to other employers and continuing to seek grant funds or offer grant writing assistance to support transit. She offered a poll question regarding public involvement next steps. "Where should staff focus outreach efforts?" The results were as follows: Riders/Users 56%, Never Riders 13%, and Voters 31%. Several members shared their reasoning for their choice. Ms. Collins thanked Board and TAC members for their discussion and noted it would be helpful to guide the next steps.

6. FUTURE OF MICROTRANSIT

-Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner

Ms. Hollander reviewed the two microtransit pilot programs in detail, including comingled metrics with paratransit. There was a lengthy discussion regarding how cost effective and climate friendly this service really is at this time, as well as the need for more data to support future funding of the service. Ms. Hollander reviewed potential goals for serving the airport in detail. She offered a poll question regarding goals. "What is the top goal for serving Flagstaff Pulliam Airport with public transportation?"





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

The results were as follows: Fill-in early morning/late night 43%, Equity 0%, Address parking challenges 21%, Reputational 21%, and Climate Action 14%. Several members shared their reasoning for their choice. There was another brief discussion about the airport service, noting concerns regarding the cost, efficiency, reputational, and environmental impacts, as well as the need for more data. Ms. Dalmolin stated she understands the desire to continue the service and the need to right-size the fleet and fare. She suggested staff return in June to discuss options with the Board.

7. ZERO EMISSION BUS TRANSITION

-Jim Wagner, Operations Director

This item was skipped and will be added to a future agenda.

8. FUTURE RIDERSHIP

-Jacki Lenner, Marketing and Communications Director

Ms. Lenner reported ridership is still down about 45 percent compared to pre-COVID and a lot has changed. She reviewed some of the challenges. She shared graphics for the welcome back riders and ride the bus due to increased gas prices marketing campaigns. She communicated a wide variety of tactics are being used. Some new marketing strategies are Mountain Line Mondays – ride for free on Mondays in June and July, promotion of mobile ticketing and stored value cards, as well as fare capping being in place. She noted she has big plans for back to school marketing. She engaged Board and TAC members with review of some data from the 2019 Never Rider survey and data we have for our partner's use of the ecoPASS program. Ms. Lenner suggested Board and TAC members plant the seed and be role models for their organizations to champion transit. She shared a recently made video targeting downtown employees to promote parking and riding the bus in a joint marketing effort between ParkFlag and Mountain Line. She communicated the focus of increasing future ridership will be to encourage employer flexibility, enhanced ecoPASS programs, and school transportation. Chair Shimoni noted his support for having ambassadors at each member agency to encourage use of transit.

9. TRANSIT POLICIES

-Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager

Ms. Morley stated staff are considering member agency policies when forming Mountain Line transit policies. She noted there would be a brief breakout session to brainstorm about getting our partner organizations where they want to go. Board and TAC members and staff were split into four breakout rooms to consider this question, "How can we help you achieve your goals?" Each group reported as follows:

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

City of Flagstaff: Director Sweet stated their overarching goal is the Climate Emergency Declaration as related to getting cars off the road, future projects, housing, resiliency, leading by example, reaching out to all vendors and those we are serving, get transit transitioned to electric vehicles, and ensure all things are sustainable. She noted a lot of Flagstaff Arts and Leadership (FALA) students ride the bus and we need to get more schools on board.

CCC: Board Vice Chair Williams requested Mountain Line keep the routes and timing to Lone Tree campus, continue the dialogue in place for the Commercial Driver's License (CDL) training course between NAU, Mountain Line, and CCC, find a way to sustain the bus pass program for those CCC students in need, and consider the unique relationship between NAU and CCC students, many use the Cline Library, perhaps a mini-route between CCC's Lone Tree campus and a specific point on the NAU campus would be helpful for those commuting between the campuses, some students may be unsure if parking is nearby, and for those who cannot afford an NAU parking pass.

NAU: TAC Vice Chair Stam explained housing for students has shifted to several locations and routes, and timing needs to be more convenient than driving to campus. Some employees and students work before and after classes, and route timing may not allow for use of transit. She stated she would like a video to push out on campus to promote use of transit.

County: Advisor Kerr explained the need for expanded reach of transit to outlying areas within the County for employees and community members. She noted funding needs to be figured out for this service.

Ms. Morley noted some of Mountain Line's strategic plan actions are dependent upon our partners. She reviewed some examples of Mountain Line's infrastructure challenges related to Sacred Peaks Health Center, the Phoenix Avenue/Milton traffic signal near the new Downtown Connection Center, and the Tacos Los Altos bus stop improvements. She also reviewed some examples of service challenges: the Route 8 extension and the relocation of Northern Arizona Healthcare. Ms. Morley conveyed there is much to achieve and transit already supports many of our partner's policies. She called attention to the Regional Plan, which is a joint City and County plan that contains transit goals and policies, as well as other policies that support transit. She posed three questions to get the discussion going related to missing policies, needed changes to implementation policies, and other actions missing to get us where we want to go. In general, some thoughts shared by members were the need to refine City policies regarding rezoning, City accountability since there are some conflicting policies, and there is need to support all modes of travel, the County needs a funding policy for service outside the City limits and getting ridership back to where it was before any expansion occurs. Ms. Morley asked members to send over any ideas they may have regarding priorities.

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

10. STRATEGIC PLAN UPDATE

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

This item was tabled to the June meeting agenda.

PROGRESS REPORTS:

There were no questions regarding the progress reports.

11. WORKFORCE UTILIZATION REPORT

-Josh Stone, Management Services Director

12. DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY UPDATES

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

13. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Dalmolin reviewed some current event highlights:

- May Anniversaries:
 - Ryan Mitchell, one year, transit operator;
 - Rosie Nez, seven years, transit operator/relief supervisor;
 - Jimmy Gray, 17 years, part time transit operator, now retired from NAU;
 - Anne Dunno, 8 years, Capital Project Manager, overseeing the CDL Training Course and the Kaspar Master Plan.
- New Employees:
 - Paul Ramos, transit operator, a couple years ago he worked in the fleet division.
 - Liz Vandersommen has completed her operator training and has been assisting with driving Mountain Line GO! She still needs to get her CDL.
 - Mitch Reddy, Montoya Fellow, shared employee with MetroPlan.
 - Mountain Line continues to have problems with staffing. Service has been reduced on Route 10 and Route 4 since early May. The service reduction of Route 4 saves approximately 1.5 staff members or 60 hours per week. She stated the hope to have full staff and reinstate Route 4 service by June 30th. There is a late June training class she hopes will reinforce our part time reserves. She noted difficulty to compete with private employer's wage increases that continue to lure employees away. Director Maher asked if other strategies have been implemented to improve employee retention. Ms. Dalmolin replied that a wage increase was done in October 2021. She noted several staff have decided to move closer to family. She communicated the CCC recruitment effort has stalled a little. She also stated that some middle

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

management openings that support operations still have not been filled. She explained staff are looking at more flexible work schedules.

- The Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) denied Mountain Line's request for a stoplight at Phoenix Avenue/Milton Road. She conveyed her appreciation for member support from Chair Shimoni, Director Sweet, and MetroPlan staff. Mountain Line requested an informal hearing to appeal the decision. ADOT upheld their denial, but they have offered some alternatives to consider.
- On April 30th, Mountain Line participated in the Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM) Festival at Fort Tuthill. A staff member was available to answer questions.
- City staff confirmed we have one applicant, Michele James, for the City Citizen Representative to the Mountain Line TAC and she should be appointed at a June meeting of the City Council. Ms. James is the Executive Director of Friends of Flagstaff 's Future. Thank you to members who assisted with this recruitment effort.
- She reminded Board members she sent an email regarding a potential change to the Rules of Procedure for the TAC regarding officer rotation by agency. The email asked if Board members were interested in considering a similar change for the Board of Directors. Only one Board member has responded. She asked the other Board members to please respond.
- The June meetings will be in hybrid format.

ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

Chair Shimoni thanked everyone for their time and robust discussion.

SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

June/July/August Working Agenda

The next TAC meeting will be on June 2, 2022 and will be a Hybrid In-Person and Zoom meeting based in Flagstaff in the VERA Conference Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. June Agenda items will include, but not be limited to the

Budget Adoption, Amend Rules of Procedure Related to TAC Officer Elections, Affirm Chair and Elect a Vice Chair, Mountain Line GO! Update, Downtown Connection Center (DCC) Update, Commercial Driver's License (CDL) Course Construction, Annual Cybersecurity Report/Information Technology (IT) Update, Procurement Resolution, Grant Resolution/Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Table, Line of Credit, Policy Updates, Initiate CEO and General Manager Evaluation Process, Meeting Calendar Review, and Delegation of Authority Updates. The June agenda will be available for review on NAIPTA's website and at NAIPTA's public posting places (listed on the NAIPTA website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the TAC.

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

The next Board meeting will be on June 15, 2022 and will be a Hybrid In-Person and Zoom meeting based in Flagstaff in the VERA Conference Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. June agenda items will include but not be limited to the Budget Adoption, Amend Rules of Procedure Related to TAC Officer Elections, Affirm Chair and Elect a Vice Chair, Mountain Line GO! Update, Downtown Connection Center (DCC) Update, Commercial Driver's License (CDL) Course Construction, Annual Cybersecurity Report/Information Technology (IT) Update, Procurement Resolution, Grant Resolution/Transportation Improvement Program (TIP) Table, Line of Credit, Policy Updates, Initiate CEO and General Manager Evaluation Process, Meeting Calendar Review, Delegation of Authority Updates, and possibly an Executive Session. The June agenda will be available for review on NAIPTA's website and at NAIPTA's public posting places (listed on the NAIPTA website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the Board.

14. ADJOURNMENT -Chair Shimoni adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:56 a.m.

Adam Shimoni, Chair of the Mountain Line Board of Directors

ATTEST:

Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

Getting you where you want to go

