



Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

Board of Directors Minutes for Wednesday, April 19, 2023

NOTE: IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA BOARD MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

The Board of Directors met in Regular Session on Wednesday, April 19, 2023, at 10:00am in the Mountain Line VERA Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004. This was a WEB BASED meeting. Members of the Board and Mountain Line staff attended in person, by internet conferencing, or by telephone. The public was invited to attend.

BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:

Tony Williams, (Chair), Dean of Student Affairs, CCC, designee, (Zoom);
Jeronimo Vasquez, (Vice Chair), Board of Supervisors, Coconino County, (Zoom);
Josh Maher, Associate VP for Community Relations, NAU, alternate, (Zoom); joined at approximately 10:05am;
Deborah Harris, City Councilor, City of Flagstaff, alternate (Zoom)

**Three of our five Board member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

***The City of Flagstaff holds two seats.*

BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Miranda Sweet, Vice Mayor, City of Flagstaff;
Lori Matthews, City Councilor, City of Flagstaff;

MOUNTAIN LINE STAFF IN ATTENDANCE:

Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager, (In Person and Zoom);
Jim Wagner, Operations Director, (Zoom), left at approximately 11:15am;
Josh Stone, Management Services Director, (Zoom), left at approximately 11:15am;
Jacki Lenners, Marketing and Communications Director, (Zoom), left at approximately 11:15am;
Sam Short, Safety Manager;
Jeremiah McVicker, Maintenance Manager, (Zoom), left at approximately 11:15am;
Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner, left at approximately 11:15am;
Mitch Reddy, Associate Transit Planner, left at approximately 11:15am;
Heather Higgins, Purchasing and Contracts Officer, (Zoom), left at approximately 11:15am;
Jon Matthies, IT Manager, (Zoom), left at approximately 11:15am;
James Olson, IT Technician; left at approximately 11:17am and returned at approximately 11:54am;
Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board;
Scott Holcomb, Mountain Line Attorney

GUESTS PRESENT:

Jason Kordosky, Member of the Public representing freemountainline.org, left at approximately 10:15am

Teresa Sharon, Transit Bus Operator and Relief Supervisor, arrival at approximately 10:10am and left at approximately 10:20am

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

Michael Shumway, Travelers Insurance, Legal Counsel for Mountain Line, arrival at approximately 11:33am during the executive session

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Williams called the meeting to order at approximately 10:00am.

2. ROLL CALL

Chair Williams asked Board members to amend the agenda, on behalf of Ms. Dalmolin, to table agenda item #9 Zero Fare Policy, to a future meeting. Ms. Dalmolin stated more time is needed to develop a plan and the proposed action is necessary to allow public comment under the Call to the Public for those who are in attendance regarding this agenda item. Vice Chair Vasquez made a motion to table item #9, Zero Fare Policy. Chair Williams seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Tony Williams	X	
Jeronimo Vasquez	X	
Josh Maher	X	
Deborah Harris	X	

3. SAFETY MINUTE
-Sam Short, Safety Manager

Mr. Short reported on Bike Safety.

4. CALL TO THE PUBLIC

There was one member of the public, Mr. Kordosky from Munds Park, Arizona 86017. He read a letter sent to the Mountain Line Board on behalf of additional members of freemountainline.org in zip codes 86001, 86004, and 86005, supporting fare-free for the Mountain Line transit system. He provided multiple data points within the letter for the Mountain Line Board to consider. Chair Williams thanked him for sharing his public comments to be considered during discussion at a future meeting.

5. MILESTONE ANNIVERSARY

Teresa Sharon was recognized for her 5 years of service.

6. APPROVAL OF MINUTES 3/22/2023

Director Maher moved to approve the minutes for March 22, 2023. Vice Chair Vasquez seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Tony Williams	X	
Jeronimo Vasquez	X	
Josh Maher	X	
Deborah Harris	X	

DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:

7. FY2022 FINANCIAL AUDIT REPORT

-Josh Stone, Management Services Director

Staff recommends the Board of Directors approve the FY2022 Financial Audit Report as completed by Fester and Chapman P.C. and filed as required by March 31, 2023.

Mr. Stone explained the requirement for the independent audit, along with Board approval and the need to file with the State. He stated the final issuance and filing occurred on the same day, March 31, 2023. He noted in Fester and Chapman's opinion, Year End was not completed timely. Mr. Stone shared that there were staffing challenges as he moved into his new position. He said a corrective action report was established to ensure future timeliness. Chair Williams asked if the Board typically approves this report before it is filed. Mr. Stone replied, yes, typically it is, but the firm did not have the report ready in time for the March Board meeting. Director Maher made a motion to approve the FY2022 Financial Audit Report as recommended. Vice Chair Vasquez seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Tony Williams	X	
Jeronimo Vasquez	X	
Josh Maher	X	
Deborah Harris	X	

8. THE METROPLAN AND MOUNTAIN LINE COORDINATED PUBLIC TRANSIT-HUMAN SERVICES TRANSPORTATION PLAN

-Mitch Reddy, Associate Transit Planner

Staff recommends the Board of Directors adopt the MetroPlan & Mountain Line Coordinated Public Transit - Human Services Transportation Plan.

Mr. Reddy shared that the Coordinated Plan goes through a major revision process every four years and this was done this year. He stated the Coordinated Mobility Council meets quarterly and they made recommendations to address gaps. He reviewed the new strategies and improved strategies briefly. He reported that two committees have been formed to address wheelchair accessibility vehicles for taxi services and simplifying the qualification process. He noted this plan was adopted by the MetroPlan Executive Board in March. There were no questions. Director Maher made a motion to adopt the Coordinated Plan as recommended. Vice Chair Vasquez seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Tony Williams	X	
Jeronimo Vasquez	X	
Josh Maher	X	
Deborah Harris	X	

9. ZERO-FARE POLICY

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Staff recommends that the Board of Directors direct staff to develop a plan to 1) test zero-fare policies as a consideration in a potential transit tax extension or expansion and 2) make Mountain Line zero-fare for all riders no later than the end of FY2025.

This item was tabled and will be considered at a future meeting per the action taken by the Board at the beginning of the meeting.

10. FY2024 CAPITAL BUDGET

-Josh Stone, Management Services Director

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Mr. Stone reviewed a PowerPoint slide with Board members related to the anticipated capital expenses and carryover for the FY2024 budget. He gave a brief status update on the major projects that the planning team usually provides regular updates on. There was a question regarding the difference between the FY2023 Budget and the FY2023 Projected. Mr. Stone explained the Projected is what has or will be spent this fiscal year and the remainder will carry over to the FY2024 Budget. Chair Williams stated his appreciation for the Capital Budget review. There was no further discussion.

11. BUS STOP EQUITY ANALYSIS UPDATE

-Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Dunno referenced the Transit Guidelines adopted by the Board in 2019 and intended for use by Mountain Line staff, City staff, and developers, informing them of the process to incorporate transit into the built environment. She explained the Transit Guidelines also allow for scoring of bus stop amenities in an equitable manner. She noted the guidelines also mention the Permanent Transit Network, the key corridors to keep transit. Ms. Dunno stated an analysis done recently showed two-thirds of bus stops fit the established criteria, but about 58 stops need improvement, including about 20 shelters. She also noted the City has not formally adopted the Transit Guidelines and staff are looking at this process. She commented on the two main reasons for less than adequate amenities is budget and right-of-way. She stated each shelter costs approximately \$30,000. She explained Mountain Line is a goodwill partner; Mountain Line does not have eminent domain, but a bus stop acquisition policy is being developed and will be brought to the Board for consideration soon. Ms. Dunno communicated that our facilities team works hard with our partners for bus stops. There was a couple questions about where funding comes from for bus stops and if private funds can be used. Ms. Dunno responded that there is no regular funding, but Mountain Line received \$500,000 under





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

the State of Good Repair grant in 2016 which is being used in this manner and she replied that Mountain Line welcomes private partnerships. There was another question about where most of the bus stops are located that need amenities. Ms. Dunno explained most of them are located along Fourth Street, Huntington, and off University; these areas are challenging due to right-of-way and sidewalk issues. She offered to provide a map and Board members expressed interest in seeing a bus stop map, especially to see the geographic equity. Vice Chair Vasquez suggested a couple areas that he felt needed bus stops. Chair Williams stated he was appreciative of the scoring rubric and agreed that a map would be helpful.

12. MOUNTAIN EXPRESS SERVICE FOR 2022-2023

-Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Hollander provided an update on the most recent season. She described the route and noted 30 minute service was offered daily December 26-January 1, then on weekends in January and February. She reported, due to weather conditions, service was not offered on January 15 and February 26. She explained that Arizona Snowbowl does pay for this service which is free to the rider. She reviewed the ridership year over year; 2018-2019 had the highest ridership. She noted service was offered at 20 minute frequency in that year and Arizona Snowbowl had a big marketing campaign as well. Ms. Hollander shared a graph of boardings which showed pickups by stop and noted that parking at Fort Valley reduced boardings at the Downtown Connection Center (DCC) and the designated Flagstaff High School Park and Ride. She communicated that Mountain Line has told Arizona Snowbowl that service next year may not serve the Fort Valley parking lot in the future as it does not align with Mountain Line's goal in providing this service, to reduce traffic on Highway 180. There was some discussion around surveying riders, comparing Arizona Snowbowl's lift ticket sales to ridership, advertising – especially related to kids skiing/snowboarding before they can drive, and how much Arizona Snowbowl pays for this service. Ms. Hollander shared that Arizona Snowbowl may be able to offer a survey in conjunction with other surveys they offer. She noted staff can ask Arizona Snowbowl for their lift ticket sales to see if there is any correlation. Ms. Hollander stated that Arizona Snowbowl does advertising, as well as Mountain Line's promotion through social media. Ms. Lenners clarified that Mountain Line ads are local, and we already have an ad campaign targeting parents to let Mountain Line do the driving for their kids; Arizona Snowbowl has further reach regarding advertising to visitors. Ms. Hollander confirmed that Arizona Snowbowl pays for 100 percent of the service. There were no more questions.

PROGRESS REPORTS:

There were no questions regarding the progress reports.

13. DELEGATIONS OF AUTHORITY

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

14. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

Ms. Dalmolin shared the following highlights:

- We are now short four bus operators.
- The Human Resources Manager candidate pulled out. Mr. Stone and Mr. Short are supporting staff.
- The electric bus will be put into service on routes next Wednesday, April 26th.
- The New Flyer electric bus will arrive in late May or early June. The recall issue related to battery compartment fire risk has been resolved.
- The electric bus will be on display at the City's Earth Day event on April 22nd.
- The electric bus will also be on display at the Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) celebration at Fort Tuthill on April 29th.
- The traffic impact analysis for Northern Arizona Healthcare was reviewed by Mountain Line and it may cause delays at three intersections. This will be discussed at future Council meetings.
- Congratulations to Mr. Stone on the Audit. He assumed his position mid-year.
- Congratulations to Mr. Reddy. He has accepted a full time position.
- April anniversaries were reviewed.

At approximately 11:15am, Director Maher made a motion to convene an executive session. Vice Chair Vasquez seconded. There was no discussion. All approved, none opposed. Motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Tony Williams	X	
Jeronimo Vasquez	X	
Josh Maher	X	
Deborah Harris	X	

EXECUTIVE SESSION

Executive sessions are closed to the public.

The Board considered a motion to convene an executive session pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3) and (4) for the following purpose:

1. Discussion and consultation with Mountain Line's attorney for legal advice and with Mountain Line's attorney and designated representatives, regarding the Riggs v. NAIPTA litigation. ARS § 38-431.03(A)(3) and (4).
2. Discussion and consultation with Mountain Line's attorney for legal advice and with Mountain Line's attorney and designated representatives, regarding the Papanastopoulos v. NAIPTA litigation. ARS § 38-431.03(A)(3) and (4).

Following the conclusion of the Executive Session, the Board reconvened the public meeting at approximately 11:54am.

Getting you where you want to go





Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

ITEMS FROM COMMITTEE AND STAFF:

Chair Williams communicated that the Board and TAC Joint meeting would be held on Wednesday, May 17th, 10am-2pm, in person at the Flagstaff, Aquaplex, 1702 N. Fourth Street.

SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

May/June Working Agenda

The Board and TAC Joint meeting will be held on Wednesday, May 17, 2023. It will be held in person at the Flagstaff Aquaplex, in the Community Room, 1702 N. Fourth Street, Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. May agenda items may include but not be limited to Budget Presentation, Strategic Plan Review, Key Performance Indicators, Review Mission, Vision, Goals, Guiding Principles, Staff Development and Succession Planning, and Delegation of Authority Updates. The May agenda will be available for review on Mountain Line's website and at Mountain Line's public posting places (listed on the Mountain Line website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the Board and TAC.

The next Board meeting will be June 21, 2023 and will be a hybrid in-person and Zoom meeting based in Flagstaff in the Mountain Line VERA Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. June agenda items will include but not be limited to Budget Approval, Key Performance Indicators Adoption, DBE Goal Setting, Procurement Resolution, Grant Resolution, Line of Credit, Personnel Policy Manual Updates, Annual Cybersecurity Report, Meeting Calendar Review, and Delegation of Authority Updates. The June agenda will be available for review on Mountain Line's website and at Mountain Line's public posting places (listed on the Mountain Line website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the Board.

15. ADJOURNMENT -Chair Williams adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:56am.

Tony Williams, Chair of the Mountain Line Board of Directors

ATTEST:

Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

Getting you where you want to go

