



## Board of Directors and Transit Advisory Committee Strategic Policy Advance Minutes for Wednesday, October 19, 2022

**NOTE:** IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA BOARD MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

The Board of Directors and Transit Advisory Committee met in Joint Session on Wednesday, October 19, 2022 at 9:00am in the Community Room at the Flagstaff Aquaplex, 1702 N. Fourth Street, Flagstaff, AZ 86004.

**Pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, persons with a disability may request a reasonable accommodation, such as a sign language interpreter, by contacting the Clerk of the Board of Directors at 928-679-8922 (TTY Service 800.367.8939). Requests should be made as early as possible to allow time to arrange the accommodation.**

Unless otherwise noted, this meeting held in the Community Room at the Flagstaff Aquaplex is open to the public. Public may observe and participate in the meeting at the address above.

### *BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:*

Tony Williams, (Vice Chair), Acting Meeting Chair, Dean of Student Affairs, CCC, designee;  
Miranda Sweet, City Council, City of Flagstaff;

Jeronimo Vasquez, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County;

Josh Maher, Associate Vice President for Community Relations, NAU, alternate;

Paul Deasy, Mayor, City of Flagstaff, alternate, left at approximately 12:10pm;

Judy Begay, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County, alternate

*\*Three of our five Board member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

*\*\*The City of Flagstaff holds two seats.*

### *BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED:*

None.

### *TAC MEMBERS PRESENT:*

Erin Stam, (Vice Chair), Director of Parking and Shuttle Services, NAU, designee;

Greg Clifton, City Manager, City of Flagstaff, arrival at approximately 11:40am;

Dave Wessel, Manager, MetroPlan, alternate;

Gillian Thomas, Citizen Representative, Coconino County;

Carol Covington, Citizen Representative, Coconino County, alternate;

Kurt Stull, Executive Director of Facilities and Security, CCC, designee;

Gail Jackson, Economic Development Representative, ECoNA, left at approximately 10:20am and returned at approximately 11:30am;

Tiffany Kerr, Health Disparities Program Manager, Coconino County, designee;





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

Michele James, Citizen Representative, City of Flagstaff;  
Brendan Trachsel, President, ASNAU;  
Brian Eekhoff, Assistant Director of Shuttle Services, NAU, alternate;  
*\*Five of our eight TAC member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

### TAC MEMBERS EXCUSED:

Jeff Meilbeck, (Chair), Executive Director, MetroPlan;  
Kim Musselman, Director of Health and Human Services, Coconino County, alternate;  
Jeff Bauman, Traffic Engineer, City of Flagstaff, alternate;  
Kinsey Kavanagh, Vice President of Student Affairs, ASNAU, alternate

### MOUNTAIN LINE STAFF PRESENT:

Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager;  
Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager;  
Jim Wagner, Operations Director;  
Josh Stone, Management Services Director;  
Jacki Lenners, Marketing and Communications Manager;  
Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager;  
Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner;  
Estella Hollander, Mobility Planner;  
Lyra Littner, Associate Transit Planner;  
Mitch Reddy, Montoya Fellow, left at approximately 1:05pm;  
Jon Matthies, IT Manager, left at approximately 9:13am;  
Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board;  
Scott Holcomb, Mountain Line Attorney;  
Kris Beecher, Mountain Line Attorney

### GUESTS PRESENT:

Rick Tadder, Management Services Director, City of Flagstaff

1. CALL TO ORDER -Vice Chair Williams called the meeting to order at approximately 9:10am.
2. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS
3. SAFETY MINUTE  
Jim Wagner, Operations Director

Mr. Wagner reported October is Pedestrian Safety Month. He shared some statistics on pedestrian deaths by motorists and offered some safety tips for motorists and pedestrians.

### DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:

4. FLAGSTAFF IN MOTION, A COMMUNITY TRANSIT PLAN PRESENTATION AND ACTIVITY #1  
-Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

Ms. Collins stated her presentation was a culmination of a process that has taken over a year. She shared rider survey results. She reviewed the ranked needs, cost estimates, and ridership estimates. Ms. Hollander reviewed On-Demand Transportation options such as Microtransit (cost per hour) and partnerships with Transportation Network Companies (TNCs – cost per trip). She described some of the benefits and challenges for each. Ms. Collins noted assumed improvements and staff recommendations for three tiers of optional improvements.

BREAK 9:50-9:55am

Ms. Collins explained the activity and answered questions. Board and TAC members and staff were split into six groups for the activity.

### 1<sup>st</sup> Tier Funding – 15 minutes/11 chips/sales tax increase for 25% more funding

Ms. Lenner: Spent all their chips on Weekday Peak Extended to 9pm - All Routes, M-F; and Route 66 Frequency - Peak 20 Minutes, M-F.

Ms. Morley: Route 66 Frequency – Peak 20 Minutes, M-F; Route 8 Extension – To Woody Mountain Road; and last priority to spend all their chips they did some bargaining, Increase Saturday Service – Span Only, not Frequency, for 4 chips.

Ms. Littner: Route 66 Frequency – Peak 20 Minutes, M-F; Route 8 Extension – To Woody Mountain; Increase Saturday Service – 10am-4pm Peak Frequency; Route 3 Frequency – Peak 20 Minutes, M-F to spend all of their chips.

Ms. Dunno: Route 8 Extension – To Woody Mountain Road; Route 66 Frequency - 20 Minutes, M-F; Increase Saturday Service – 10am-4pm Peak Frequency; and Span Smooth Weekdays to 11pm – Routes 4,5, 7, 8, and 14 to spend all of their chips.

Ms. Hollander: Route 8 Extension – To Woody Mountain Road; Route 66 Frequency - Peak 20 Minutes, M-F; Route 66 Frequency - Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Route 3 Frequency - Peak 20 Minutes, M-F; and Span Smooth Weekdays to 11pm – Routes 4,5, 7, 8, and 14 to spend all of their chips.

Mr. Wagner: Route 66 Frequency - Peak 20 Minutes, M-F; Route 66 Frequency - Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Span Smooth Weekdays to 11pm – Routes 4,5, 7, 8, and 14; Route 8 Extension – To Woody Mountain Road; and Increase Saturday Service – 10am-4pm Peak Frequency.

### 2<sup>nd</sup> Tier Funding – 10 minutes/18 chips/sales tax increase for 50% more funding

Ms. Morley: Route 66 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Route 3 Frequency – Peak 20 Minutes, M-F; Route 3 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Ponderosa Trails and Airport – Fixed Route; Weekday Peak Extended to 9pm – All Routes, M-F; and Span Smooth Weekdays to 11pm – Routes 4, 5, 7, 8, and 14 to spend all of their chips.

Ms. Littner: They spent all of their chips on 20 Minute Peak Frequency – All Routes, M-F; Modified Span Smooth Weekdays to 11pm on Routes 5, 7, and 8; Late Night TNC – Friday 11pm-2:30am, Saturday 8pm-2:30am; and Kachina Village – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm.

Ms. Dunno: 20 Minute Peak Frequency – All Routes, M-F, except for Route 5; Increase Saturday Service – Match Weekday Frequency and Span; Route 3 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; and last chip was unspent.

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

Ms. Hollander: 20 Minute Peak Frequency – All Routes, M-F; Increase Saturday Service – 10am-4pm Peak Frequency; Route 3 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Ponderosa Trails and Airport – Fixed Route, got creative and changed routing to include the hospital; and Kachina Village – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6am-9am and 3-6pm.

Mr. Wagner: 20 Minute Peak Frequency – All Routes, M-F, negotiated down from 15 to 11 chips due to Route 66 Frequency being chosen in the first round; Increased Saturday Service – Match Weekday Frequency and Span, similarly modified from eight to six chips; and last chip spent on Route 3 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F.

Ms. Lenners: All chips were spent; 20 Minute Peak Frequency – All Routes, M-F, bargaining from 15 down to 13 chips due to Route 66 Frequency being chosen in the first round; Route 8 Extension – To Woody Mountain Road; Route 66 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; and Span Smooth Weekdays to 11pm – Routes 4, 5, 7, 8, and 14.

### 3rd Tier Funding - 10 minutes/21 chips/sales tax increase for 75% more funding

Ms. Morley: 12am Service End – All Routes, 7 Days a Week; Kachina Village – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm; Doney Park – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm; Bellemont – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm; and Fort Valley – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm.

Ms. Littner: Some negotiating was done for 12am Service End – All Routes, 7 Days a Week due to investment in prior rounds and not necessarily needed on all routes, removed Sunday; Ponderosa Trails and Airport – Fixed Route; Route 66 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Route 3 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Fort Valley – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm; and Doney Park – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm.

Ms. Dunno: Ponderosa Trails and Airport – Fixed Route, would like to add the hospital, thought that was a great idea; Weekday Peak Extended to 9pm – All Routes, M-F; Late Night TNC – Friday 11pm-2:30am, Saturday 11pm-2:30am; and Kachina Village – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm.

Ms. Hollander: Increase Saturday Service – Match Weekday Frequency and Span and one chip was added to request 20 minute service; Weekday Peak Extended to 9pm – All Routes, M-F; and Late Night TNC - Friday 11pm-2:30am, Saturday 8pm-2:30am.

Mr. Wagner: 12am Service End – All Routes, 7 Days a Week; Kachina Village – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm with addition of a Park and Ride; Ponderosa Trails and Airport – Fixed Route, as a Bus Rapid Transit (BRT); and Doney Park – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm with addition of a Park and Ride.

Ms. Lenners: Spent all but one chip; Increased Saturday Service – Match Weekday Frequency and Span; Route 3 Frequency – Off Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Some bargaining done for 12am Service End – All Routes, 7 Days a Week, removed Sunday; and modify Late Night TNC – Friday and Saturday, 12-2:30am only.

### 4th Tier Funding – 5 minutes/19 chips/sales tax increase for 100% more funding

Ms. Morley: Finished investing in 20 Minute Peak Frequency – All Routes, M-F for 9 chips; Then got creative and spent 3 chips on morning service, starting earlier, and spent 7 chips working our way toward 2:30am by fixed route, not TNC. A couple new services there.

Ms. Littner: Bellemont – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm; Ms. Dalmolin: Would like to buy into Ms. Morley's plan for early morning service.

*Getting you where you want to go*







## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

Ms. Dunno: Finish out the County coverage Commuter Routes in Doney Park, Bellemont, and Fort Valley; 12am Service End – All Routes, 7 Days a Week; commented that TNC from 12am to start of fixed route service may be beneficial.

Ms. Hollander: Doney Park – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm, with Park and Ride; 12am Service End – All Routes, 7 Days a Week; and Late Night TNC – Friday 11pm-2:30am, Saturday 11pm-2:30am, but make it fixed route; and change their Tier 2 to expand the loop from the DCC to the hospital to the Airport to Lone Tree, but two loops.

Mr. Wagner: Some negotiation done for University Heights and Ponderosa Trails – Microtransit; Route 5 Frequency – Peak 30 Minutes, M-F; Fort Valley – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm; and Switzer Canyon – Microtransit.

Ms. Lenner: Only spent 12 chips; they did not like the return on investment for microtransit; Ponderosa Trails and Airport – Fixed Route; Doney Park – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm; and Kachina Village – Fixed Route Commuter, M-F, 6-9am and 3-6pm.

A discussion followed regarding policies, opportunities to gain support of other agencies, and coordination efforts. Specifically, Ms. Dalmolin stated Mountain Line provides transit on behalf of the City, utilizing the dedicated transit tax approved by voters, but our challenge is that transit is not in City codes. She asked how transit becomes part of City code for development, just like roads, bike, and pedestrian access to move within our community. She noted Mountain Line has plans, but we don't have a mechanism to ensure transit is considered. She stated her appreciation of this being brought forward. Ms. Morley stated the activity this morning will help define an increase in the transit tax and Mountain Line will be looking for partnerships. She explained staff will continue to be creative. There may be grant opportunities available as mentioned by Mr. Wessel.

Mr. Beecher reported on the Navajo Nation political situation and potential partnerships with Mountain Line.

### 5. STRATEGIC PLAN UPDATE AND WORKPLAN DEVELOPMENT

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Dalmolin explained the Strategic Plan was adopted by the Board of Directors in 2020; a five-year plan for which she would like to develop a 12-18 month work plan. She asked the Board and TAC members if they would like to update the plan or remove the tasks. The consensus was to keep the tasks and the original plan intact for ease of recognizing progress. Ms. Dalmolin stated she would bring back a draft work plan next month and key performance indicators (KPIs) would be updated annually.

### 6. LUNCH 11:50am-12:20pm

### 7. FLAGSTAFF IN MOTION, A COMMUNITY TRANSIT PLAN PRESENTATION

-Bizzy Collins, Transit Planner

Ms. Collins reviewed a spreadsheet of results from the morning activity. She stated she would confirm all equations are good since some seemed not quite right. She reviewed next steps with

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

the results from the activity becoming the final list of priorities to go to the Citizen Advisory Committee (CAC) in two weeks. She noted some minor refinement may be needed and hopefully the plan will go to the Board for adoption in January. She explained from there a survey of likely voters would be done, and a tax package could be considered. There was a brief discussion about Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) improvements not being included in the five-year plan. Ms. Collins explained there is a separate funding source for a BRT route which is the Capital Improvement Grant (CIG). There was a comment about microtransit not offering a good return on investment. There was no further discussion.

### 8. FINANCIAL PLAN REVIEW

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Dalmolin reported Mountain Line's existing funding is based on expense valuation from 2000; funding questions were not modified for cost inflation when pursuing the renewal initiative in 2008 or 2016. She noted costs have increased by 30 percent in the last six years; fuel cost alone has increased by roughly 70 percent in the last year. She shared that each electric bus costs around \$200,000 more than our hybrid electric buses. She listed capital needs as the Kaspar Master Plan, the Downtown Connection Center (DCC), and our Bus Shelter Program. She listed multiple assumption for the 10-year financial outlook. She noted the fund balance dips in FY2024 due to the construction of the DCC, and a projected recession by the City in FY2027; fleet replacement will also need to begin during this time. There were questions about the lifespan of a bus, a ballot measure in 2024, the cost of electric, and a potential recession sooner. Ms. Dalmolin and Mr. Tadder answered all questions. The next steps are to consider the impact to go "Zero Fare" and to enlist a Citizen Advisory Committee (CAC) to help determine future funding options and or tax question(s). There was no further discussion.

### 9. DOWNTOWN CONNECTION CENTER BUDGET UPDATE

-Kate Morley, Deputy General Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Morley stated things are moving quickly now. She reported AECOM was the consultant that developed 30 percent design necessary to get Mountain Line through the Conditional Use Permit (CUP) process, and the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) process. She stated HDR is now onboard to do final design. She noted the Rio de Flag project will impact Phase 2 of the DCC project. She explained a review of the project budget shows Phase 1, the building, will take all \$26 million of available funds at this point; leaving a budget deficit of \$12 million for Phase 2. She noted the cost could escalate further and reiterated that we have no known timeline for Phase 2. She conveyed that staff would have the option to pursue additional federal funding and/or a Transportation Infrastructure Finance and Innovation Act (TIFIA) loan, a federal low cost loan, to pursue Phase 2 when ready. Ms. Dalmolin added that staff could also continue to pursue grants to pay back the TIFIA loan, if a TIFIA loan was secured. She also confirmed that the \$12 million shortfall is not accounted for in the fund balance. Ms. Morley reviewed the design elements and space needs for the building, and the redesign of the entrance. There was some discussion regarding the parking garage and civic space. Mr. Clifton stated the City should know more about

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

the Rio de Flag timeline very soon. The consensus was to proceed with the building. Vice Chair Williams stated his appreciation of the entrance redesign and said he thought it was much better. There was no further discussion.

### PROGRESS REPORTS:

**10. DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY UPDATE**

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

There were no questions regarding this report.

**11. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS**

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Dalmolin shared three anniversaries. She also reported a few promotions, due to implementation of a reorganization of fleet to recognize need for succession planning.

### SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

November/January Working Agenda

The next TAC meeting will be Thursday, November 3, 2022 and will be a hybrid in person/Zoom meeting based in Flagstaff in the Mountain Line VERA Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. November agenda items will include but not be limited to the Strategic Plan Work Plan Adoption, Route 10 Optimization, Kaspar Headquarters Master Plan Adoption, Bus Stop Acquisition Policy, Budget Process Kickoff, Flagstaff in Motion, TAC Citizen Business/Economic Development Representative Appointment, Reallocation of Grant Funds from Kaspar/Route 66 Intersection, Workforce Utilization Report, and Delegation of Authority Updates. The November agenda will be available for review on Mountain Line's website and at Mountain Line's public posting places (listed on the Mountain Line website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the TAC.

The next Board meeting will be Wednesday, November 16, 2022 and will be a hybrid in person/Zoom meeting based in Flagstaff in the Mountain Line VERA Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. November agenda items will include but not be limited to the Strategic Plan Work Plan Adoption, Route 10 Optimization, Kaspar Headquarters Master Plan Adoption, Bus Stop Acquisition Policy, Budget Process Kickoff, Flagstaff in Motion, TAC Citizen Business/Economic Development Representative Appointment, Reallocation of Grant Funds from Kaspar/Route 66 Intersection, Workforce Utilization Report, and Delegation of Authority Updates. The November agenda will be available for review on Mountain Line's website and at Mountain Line's public posting places (listed on the Mountain Line website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the Board.

**12. ADJOURNMENT**

-Vice Chair Williams adjourned the meeting at approximately 1:30pm.

*Getting you where you want to go*





## **Mountain Line**

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

---

Adam Shimoni, Chair, Mountain Line Board of Directors

ATTEST:

---

Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

*Getting you where you want to go*

