



## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

# Board of Directors and Transit Advisory Committee Joint Meeting Minutes for Wednesday, October 16, 2024

NOTE: IN ACCORDANCE WITH PROVISIONS OF THE ARIZONA REVISED STATUTES THE SUMMARIZED MINUTES OF NAIPTA BOARD MEETINGS ARE NOT VERBATIM TRANSCRIPTS. ONLY THE ACTIONS TAKEN AND DISCUSSION APPEARING WITHIN QUOTATION MARKS ARE VERBATIM.

The Board of Directors and Transit Advisory Committee met in Joint Session on Wednesday, October 16, 2024 at 9:00am in the Training Room at Mountain Line, 3773 North Kaspar Drive, Flagstaff, AZ 86004. Members of the Board and TAC, and Mountain Line staff attended in person. The public was invited to attend.

### *BOARD MEMBERS PRESENT:*

Tony Williams, (Chair), Dean of Student Affairs, CCC, designee;  
Miranda Sweet, City Council, City of Flagstaff, arrival at approximately 9:18am;  
Lori Matthews, City Council, City of Flagstaff;  
Josh Maher, Associate Vice President for Community Relations, NAU, alternate;  
*\*Three of our five Board member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*  
*\*\*The City of Flagstaff holds two seats.*

### *BOARD MEMBERS EXCUSED:*

Jeronimo Vasquez, (Vice Chair), Board of Supervisors, Coconino County;  
Judy Begay, Board of Supervisors, Coconino County, alternate;  
Deborah Harris, City Council, City of Flagstaff, alternate

### *TAC MEMBERS PRESENT:*

Greg Clifton, (Chair), City Manager, City of Flagstaff, arrival at approximately 9:23am and left at approximately 10:55am;  
Kurt Stull, (Vice Chair), Executive Director of Facilities and Security, CCC, designee, left at approximately 11:10am;  
Erin Stam, Director of Parking and Shuttle Services, NAU, designee, left at approximately 11:10am;  
Dave Wessel, Manager, MetroPlan, designee, left at approximately 11:10am;  
Michele James, Citizen Representative, City of Flagstaff, left at approximately 11:10am;  
Carol Covington, Citizen Representative, Coconino County, left at approximately 11:10am;  
Kim Musselman, Deputy County Manager, Coconino County, designee, left at approximately 11:10am;  
Karli Vander Meersch, President, ASNAU, left at approximately 11:10am  
*\*Five of our eight TAC member seats must be present to constitute a quorum.*

### *TAC MEMBERS EXCUSED:*

Gail Jackson, Economic Development Representative, ECoNA;  
Kate Morley, Interim Executive Director, MetroPlan, alternate;  
Jeff Bauman, Traffic Engineer, City of Flagstaff, alternate;  
Rafy Rivera, Assistant Director of Shuttle Services, NAU, alternate

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

### *MOUNTAIN LINE STAFF PRESENT:*

Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager;

Jacki Lenners, Deputy General Manager;

Steve Hamelin, Interim Operations Director, left at approximately 11:10am;

Sam Short, Workforce Director, left at approximately 9:08am;

Anne Dunno, Capital Project Manager, left at approximately 11:10am;

Jeremiah McVicker, Maintenance Superintendent, left at approximately 11:10am;

Estella Hollander, Mobility Manager;

Codi Weaver, Human Resources Manager, left at approximately 11:10am;

Bizzy Collins, Strategic Performance Planner;

Peter Farness, Bus Operator Fulltime, arrival at approximately 9:05am and left at approximately 9:15am;

Jon Matthies, IT Manager; left at approximately 11:12am and returned at approximately 11:58am;

Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board, left at approximately 11:12am and returned at approximately 11:58am;

Scott Holcomb, Mountain Line Attorney

Cameron Stanley, Mountain Line Attorney

### *GUESTS PRESENT:*

Ehren Bingaman, TransPro Consulting, left at approximately 9:45am;

1. CALL TO ORDER -Chair Williams called the meeting to order at approximately 9:00am.

2. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS

3. SAFETY MINUTE

Sam Short, Workforce Director

Mr. Short stated that October is Fire Prevention Month. He shared fire prevention and safety tips.

4. MILESTONE ANNIVERSARIES

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Dalmolin reviewed the September and October milestone anniversaries.

### **DISCUSSION / ACTION ITEMS:**

**The order of some agenda items was changed at the meeting based on timing.**

5. SUCCESSION PLAN

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Dalmolin shared that Mountain Line is seeking feedback and questions from the Board on a proposed Succession Plan effort designed to ensure agency resiliency to changes. She shared

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

that Mountain Line was not prepared when Mr. Wagner, Operations Director, decided to retire last January and we need to be better prepared for future changes. Using the HR Services contract, Mountain Line has opened a task order for preparing a Plan and developing implementation strategies to guide staff development to support the plan. Mr. Bingaman, from TransPro, was introduced and he presented information on why it is important to have a succession plan and what the benefits are to having a succession plan in place. Five key next steps were shared. He stated the framework to support a Succession Plan is in place for use when needed. There was a question about what resources Mountain Line has for training for key positions. Ms. Dalmolin stated that Mountain Line has a budget for collaborative training opportunities and it is available to all staff if and when there is a training of interest. There was a brief discussion about Train the Trainer opportunities. Ms. Dalmolin noted Mountain Line staff are taking advantage of Train the Trainer models when possible. Mr. Bingaman communicated that if a certain employee has potential to move up within the organization, it is good to invest in the employee's potential in specific areas of expertise. There was no further discussion.

### 6. ELECTRIC BUS PERFORMANCE REPORT

-Bizzy Collins, Strategic Performance Planner

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Collins stated she last provided electric bus information in March when there was only four months of data. She noted this report would include data from September through June. She confirmed that per the June discussion, Mountain Line has four battery electric buses on order. She explained this report is based on the two electric buses in our current fleet, one Gillig and one New Flyer, as well as the two different types of chargers; the new pantograph charger was installed on August 27<sup>th</sup>. She stated she is always open to changes as she reviewed the data which is not always apples to apples. She reviewed Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) and comparisons with peers. She reported that starting the buses inside is helpful and the buses are doing well with gallons of diesel avoided; emissions are saved by the buses we operate. Also, the energy cost per mile is a good trend. There was a lengthy discussion about battery life, charging time, cost of battery electric buses and the cost of battery replacement, breakeven point, cost of utilities attributed to an all-electric fleet, and evolving technology. Ms. Collins stated she will bring back some current and potential costs as staff update the financial plan with these costs.

### 7. BIANNUAL PERFORMANCE REPORT

-Bizzy Collins, Strategic Performance Planner

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Collins discussed the benchmarks and charts in her presentation. There were questions about ADA accessible (wheelchair accessible) van availability and how current ridership compares to pre-COVID. Ms. Collins stated the current vehicles are used for both paratransit and microtransit and noted that bus ridership is not quite back to pre-COVID levels. Ms. Dalmolin reminded the Board and TAC members that Mountain Line was offering reduced service for the majority of last year. Ms. Collins reviewed the FY2024 Strategic Plan scorecard and statistics. She noted that community engagement is strong. There were a couple more questions about our method for capturing riders that have a car and if any routes changed due to serving Flagstaff

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

Unified School District (FUSD). Ms. Collins stated that customer based surveys are used to find out about riders by choice and there were no changes to the routes for FUSD. There were no further questions.

### 8. FY2024 ANNUAL REPORT

-Josh Stone, Management Services Director

Staff recommends the Board of Directors approve the FY2024 Annual Report and authorize staff to submit the report to the State of Arizona and partner agencies as required in the Master IGA.

Ms. Dalmolin presented this report on behalf of Mr. Stone. She noted the Annual Report was developed to meet a state requirement. She stated that Ms. Collins had just provided a thorough report on the performance data, so this report will focus on the financial summary portions of the Annual Report. She reported on the revenues from partners, federal funds, and Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) pass through federal funds. She reviewed expenses by program and type. There were a couple questions about the total expenses for Mountain Line and what happens if the transit tax increase doesn't pass. Ms. Dalmolin replied that the total expenses are \$25.7 million for the balanced budget, and she noted that there will be future opportunities to seek extension of the transit tax and confirmed that there are plans being developed to protect transit programs if the transit tax doesn't pass. Director Matthews moved to approve the FY2024 Annual Report. Director Sweet seconded the motion. All approved, none opposed. The motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Tony Williams	X	
Miranda Sweet	X	
Lori Matthews	X	
Josh Maher	X	

### 9. FY2025 PROJECTIONS

-Josh Stone, Management Services Director

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Staff asked for this report to be moved to the November meeting.

### 10. CAPITAL PLANNING AND GRANT FUNDING

-Estella Hollander, Planning Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Hollander reviewed the capital planning process and the history of grant funding statistics. She explained the FY2024 Federal Funding Awards pie chart; the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) grants are formula and competitive funds, as well as specific grant programs for large projects. She noted ADOT also has a competitive grant funding process. She reviewed all Mountain Line open grants and pending grant awards. There were no questions.

### 11. TRANSIT TAX UPDATE

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

-Jacki Lenner, Deputy General Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Lenner reported there are 21 days until election day. She explained that Mountain Line is asking to extend and expand the transit tax. She noted employees can only educate and Lumen Strategies has been contracted to assist in the efforts. She informed the Board and TAC members that Mountain Line has a website for Proposition 488 and staff have been providing presentations to community groups. Additionally, there was an Open House held with the City and the County in late September. She noted other strategies being used are postings at City kiosks and targeted postcards and text messages. She stated that the feedback so far has been overwhelmingly positive. She explained there is a complimentary effort to support voting yes on the ballot, but that Mountain Line has not been part of that effort except to check information for accuracy. She also mentioned Mountain Line will offer free service on election day as has been done in the past and as is done by transit across the nation in an effort to improve access to voting. Ms. Lenner stated that staff will be back with a plan in the future whether the tax passes or does not and she offered either a presentation to groups or flyers for agencies if they want them. Ms. Dalmolin noted that she did an Arizona Daily Sun interview on the prior day. There were no questions.

### 12. MOUNTAIN EXPRESS UPDATE

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Ms. Dalmolin stated that discussions have started with Arizona Snowbowl, and they have requested changes to the service Mountain Line has offered in the past. She noted that transit frequency is key to promoting use and garnering ridership; ideally this route would have 20-minute frequency. She said Arizona Snowbowl pays the total cost of the service and staff have provided the updated cost for this season. She noted, under FTA rules, Mountain Line is not allowed to offer charter service. She explained that the Arizona Snowbowl built a new parking lot several years ago and that transit may no longer be necessary for their business, but that transit was introduced as part of efforts to relieve congestion on Highway 180 and for community relations. Ms. Dalmolin shared that as it stands, Arizona Snowbowl does not want to provide the recommended 20-minute frequency and are even declining level of service provided last year, which was 30-minute frequency, in favor of 45 minute frequency. They further want to drop the Flagstaff High School Park and Ride location to focus on transit serving local riders, all of which is highly concerning. She communicated that this level of frequency is likely to result in buses with low ridership which could negatively impact Mountain Line's reputation and further, staff are afraid this change is designed to ensure this service fails and therefore ends after this year. There was a brief discussion about the number of days of service, whether there is an opportunity for increased frequency at the beginning of the day, difficulty in messaging a change of timing in the schedule with sales of half day lift tickets, timeline of ongoing negotiations, and no response from Arizona Snowbowl staff despite efforts to reach them, as well as the potential difficult public relations situation with the transit tax pending. Ms. Dalmolin stated that the Mountain Express ridership also impacts our Small Transit Intensive Cities (STIC) funding.

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · www.mountainline.az.gov

A 10-minute break was requested at 10:55am.

The meeting resumed at approximately 11:08am with Chair Williams requesting to table the last Discussion/Action item on the agenda, In Person Meetings, and move into an executive session. At approximately 11:10am, Director Sweet made said motion and Director Matthews seconded the motion. All approved, none opposed. The motion carried.

NAME	YES VOTE	NO VOTE
Tony Williams	X	
Miranda Sweet	X	
Lori Matthews	X	
Josh Maher	X	

Executive sessions are closed to the public.

### EXECUTIVE SESSION:

The executive session is pursuant to A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A) for the following purpose:

1. Discussion and consultation with Mountain Line's attorneys for legal advice and with Mountain Line's attorneys and representatives regarding negotiation of the Arizona Snowbowl service contract. A.R.S. § 38-431.03(A)(3) & (4)

Following the conclusion of the Executive Session, the Board reconvened the public meeting.

#### 13. FY2025 EMPLOYEE ENGAGEMENT SURVEY RESULTS

-Codi Weaver, Human Resources Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

Staff asked for this report to be to be moved to the November meeting.

#### 14. IN PERSON MEETINGS

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

The Board may provide direction, but there is no recommendation from staff at this time.

This report was tabled until the November meeting.

### PROGRESS REPORTS:

Progress reports were not addressed, it was only noted that if a member would like to request an item be placed on a future agenda, they may do so.

#### 15. WAGE CHANGE IMPACT

-Codi Weaver, Human Resources Manager

#### 16. TRIPQUEST

-Jacki Lenners, Deputy General Manager

*Getting you where you want to go*





## Mountain Line

3773 N. Kaspar Drive · Flagstaff, AZ 86004 · 928-679-8900 · FAX 928-779-6868 · [www.mountainline.az.gov](http://www.mountainline.az.gov)

17. DELEGATION OF AUTHORITY UPDATE

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

18. SUMMARY OF CURRENT EVENTS

-Heather Dalmolin, CEO and General Manager

Ms. Dalmolin did not share current events at this meeting due to the addition of an executive session.

SCHEDULE NEXT MEETING DATE AND IDENTIFY AGENDA ITEMS

November/January Working Agenda

The next TAC meeting will be Thursday, November 14, 2024 and will be a hybrid in person/Zoom meeting based in Flagstaff in the Mountain Line VERA Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. November agenda items will include but not be limited to the Legislative Priorities, Budget Process Kickoff, Grant Award Notification, Maintenance Project Update, Workforce Utilization Report, and Delegation of Authority Updates. The November agenda will be available for review on Mountain Line's website and at Mountain Line's public posting places (listed on the Mountain Line website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the TAC.

The next Board meeting will be Wednesday, November 20, 2024 and will be a hybrid in person/Zoom meeting based in Flagstaff in the Mountain Line VERA Room, 3773 N. Kaspar Dr., Flagstaff, AZ 86004 at 10am. The public is invited to attend. November agenda items will include but not be limited to the Legislative Priorities, Budget Process Kickoff, Grant Award Notification, Maintenance Project Update, Workforce Utilization Report, and Delegation of Authority Updates. The November agenda will be available for review on Mountain Line's website and at Mountain Line's public posting places (listed on the Mountain Line website) at least 24 hours prior to the meeting and should be consulted for a list of items that will come before the Board.

19. ADJOURNMENT -Chair Williams reconvened the public meeting and adjourned the meeting at approximately 11:58am.

---

Tony Williams, Chair, Mountain Line Board of Directors

ATTEST:

---

Rhonda Cashman, Executive Assistant and Clerk of the Board

*Getting you where you want to go*

